



Trustees of Boise State University
Trustees of Idaho State University
Trustees of Lewis-Clark State College
Board of Regents of the University of Idaho
State Board for Career Technical Education

**STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING
December 18, 2019
Office of the State Board of Education
Len B. Jordan Building
650 W State Street, 3rd Floor
Boise, Idaho**

A regularly scheduled meeting of the State Board of Education was held via teleconference on Wednesday, December 18, 2019, with the call originating from the large conference room in the Office of the State Board of Education, Len B. Jordan Building, in Boise, Idaho. Board President Debbie Critchfield presided and called the meeting to order at 9:00am MST.

Present:

Debbie Critchfield, President
Dr. David Hill, Vice President
Andrew Scoggin*, Secretary
Emma Atchley

Dr. Linda Clark
Shawn Keough
Kurt Liebich
Sherri Ybarra, State Superintendent

*Except where noted

Wednesday, December 18, 2019

BOARDWORK

1. Agenda Review / Approval

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill/Clark): I move to approve the agenda as modified. The motion carried 8-0.

Board Vice President Hill requested unanimous consent to move item #7 from the Consent Agenda to the State Department of Education Agenda, there were no objections.

2. Minutes Review / Approval

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill/Scoggin): I move to approve the minutes from the October 16-17, 2019 Regular Board Meeting and November 26, 2019 Special Board Meeting as submitted. The motion carried 7-0, with Mr. Liebich abstaining.

3. Rolling Calendar

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill/Scoggin): I move to set December 17, 2020 as the date for the December 2020 regularly scheduled Board meeting. The motion carried 8-0.

Board Member Keough inquired as to whether the December meeting is traditionally held during this particular week, and Board President Critchfield confirmed. Mrs. Critchfield also confirmed that the December 2020 Board Meeting will be held via teleconference.

4. Board Performance Measures

This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Board President Critchfield introduced the item and reminded the Board that the Board Performance Measures will be a regular item on Board Meeting agendas, and stated that it will be a good supporting document throughout all Board discussions. Board Member Andrew Scoggin prefaced the discussion by stating that it is important that the Board be focused on the items that have been chosen as measurements for success. He reminded the Board that this meeting is abbreviated, and the discussion of this topic at the February Board Meeting will be more in-depth. He asked that Board members continue to review and consider any changes or updates that need to be made. Board President Critchfield stated that any questions or suggestions for revision may be sent to Tracie Bent, Idaho State Board of Education's Chief Planning and Policy Officer.

Board Member Clark stated that the Statewide Longitudinal Data System (SLDS) report may influence the items included in the Board Performance Measures. The SLDS is the states longitudinal data system that is intended to track students' progress from their entry into the public school system, regardless of the grade, all the way through to their entry into the job market. Dr. Clark stated that the current Board Performance Measures do not reflect this data, and that the February Board Meeting may be an opportunity to revise the performance measures to take the data collected by the SLDS into consideration.

Board Member Scoggin inquired about setting goals for student performance levels, stating that there is one report available that discusses reading proficiency for K-12 students. He inquired as to when the Board will discuss these findings in order to set benchmarks for student performance levels.

Superintendent Ybarra stated that the February Board Meeting will be the first occasion that the Board will be able to view the new data that is available. Dr. Clark said that the current benchmarks do not take the new sets of data into account, and applying the data will make the goals more applicable. Superintendent Ybarra stated that the US Department of Education has adjusted the timeline for submitting updates to the long-term and annual targets established in the state consolidated plan in accordance with the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) from mid-March to the first week of February; the Board is able to make changes at any time, but this timeframe is when the US Department of Education will review and approve submissions.

President Critchfield stated that the Board will submit a new consolidated state plan to meet the ESSA requirements next year. The Board will be able to edit goals once data for this year is available, and communicate the plan prior to the start of school in the fall. It is anticipated an updated completed plan would be available by June 2020. Ms. Bent stated that the Board is scheduled to update the Board's K-20 education strategic plan during the February Board Meeting, and that the plan must be submitted to the Division of Financial Management (DFM) by the first week of July. The February and April Board Meetings will be work meetings for the strategic plan and performance measures. Board Member Clark pointed out that only proficiency scores were available when current goals were set, and that new goals should include proficiency as well as depth and applicability of knowledge.

Board Member Liebich inquired as to whether there were any implications for not achieving goals set within the ESSA plan, and Superintendent Ybarra stated that there is only risk if there is no plan in place. She added that the Board Members are the "stewards of the plan", and reiterated that while the US Department of Education will only review plans in February, the Board can review or revise the plan at any time. Superintendent Ybarra went on to say that there is no "punishment" for schools who are not meeting ESSA plan goals or criteria, but rather there is added assistance for schools who are struggling to meet the benchmarks detailed in the plan.

Board Member Scoggin inquired as to whether there are any goals in place for the number of certificates or degrees produced by institutions per year. President Critchfield stated that this item will be discussed at the February Board Meeting. Board Member Liebich emphasized that goals set by the Board should be achievable in order to motivate change. President Critchfield emphasized the element of accountability in setting and achieving goals, stating that accountability lies in different places at the State and Federal Level, but suggested that the accountability should also be funneled into the individual districts. Additionally, she mentioned that there should be accountability within individual communities to aid in driving State initiatives.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

CONSENT

BOARD ACTION:

M/S (Hill/Clark): I move to approve the consent agenda as modified. The motion carried 8-0.

BUSINESS AFFAIRS AND HUMAN RESOURCES (BAHR) - Section II – Finance

1. Boise State University – Amendment to Licensed User Agreement with Ticketmaster

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill/Clark): I move to approve the Amendment to Licensed User Agreement with Ticketmaster, LLC and authorize the Chief Financial Officer of Boise State University to execute the same. The motion carried 8-0.

Board Member Atchley, BAHR Committee Chair, shared that when the BAHR Committee reviewed items #1, #3, and #4 on the Consent Agenda, there was discussion of having collaboration among the institutions to continue to look for ways to approach contracts that would work state-wide, especially in regard to services that all institutions require, such as commencement services.

There were no additional comments or questions from the Board.

2. Item pulled prior to finalization of agenda
3. Boise State University – Designated Depository Contract with JP Morgan

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill/Clark): I move to approve the request to designate JP Morgan Chase as the designated depository for Boise State University and to revoke the prior designation of Wells Fargo as the designated depository after the transition to JP Morgan Chase is complete. The motion carried 8-0.

4. Boise State University – Commencement Production Services Contract with Production Services International

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill/Clark): I move to approve the request by Boise State University to extend the commencement services contract with Production Services International for a total cost not to exceed \$1,075,072. The motion carried 8-0.

INSTRUCTION, RESEARCH AND STUDENT AFFAIRS (IRSA)

5. Idaho State University – Basic Technical Certificate Surveying Technician

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill/Clark): I move to approve the request by Idaho State University to add a technical certificate Surveying Technician as presented, and to include an online program fee of \$330.00 per credit, in conformance with the program budget submitted to the Board in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

PLANNING, POLICY AND GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS (PPGA)

6. University President Approved Alcohol Permits

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill/Clark): I move to accept the report on institution president approved alcohol permits as provided in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION (SDE)

7. Idaho State University (ISU) Proposed Endorsement Programs: Deaf/Hard of Hearing (K-12) and Family Consumer Science (6-12)

BOARD ACTION

M/S (--/--): I move to accept the Professional Standards Commission recommendation to conditionally approve the Deaf/Hard of Hearing (K-12) endorsement program offered through Idaho State University as submitted in Attachment 1. This item was moved from the Consent Agenda to the State Department of Education Agenda. The Board took action on this item during the State Department of Education Agenda.

AND

M/S (--/--): I move to accept the Professional Standards Commission Recommendation to conditionally approve the Family and Consumer Science (6-12) endorsement program offered through Idaho State University as submitted in Attachment 2. This item was moved from the Consent Agenda to the State Department of Education Agenda. The Board took action on this item during the State Department of Education Agenda.

8. University of Idaho – Theater Arts Endorsement Program

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill/Clark): I move to accept the Professional Standards Commission recommendation to conditionally approve the Theater Arts (5-9 or 6-12) endorsement program offered through the University of Idaho as submitted in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

9. Professional Standards Commission – Emergency Provisional Certificates

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill/Clark): I move to accept the recommendation of the Professional Standards Commission to issue one-year emergency provisional certificates for Heather Bullington, Bartholomew Mestelle, Brittany Zeigler, Chad Lawson, Kaylen Anderson, Grace Campos, Tammy Cooper, Angela Solis, James Rife, Fauna Woehlke, Matthew Schug, Janell Hodsdon, Laree Cook, Katelyn Fennell, Jessica Gill, Miranda Jones, Travis Kent, Kelsi Sagers, Allison Stevenson, Mary Williams, Eileen Bromgard, Rebekah Zorrilla, Christine Hauger, and Laura Burns to teach the content area and grade ranges at the specified school districts as provided herein for the 2019-2020 school year. The motion carried 8-0.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

1. Developments in K-12 Education

This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Superintendent Ybarra shared that four Idaho schools are being recognized for helping at-risk students. The Nez Perce School in the Nez Perce District was honored in the category of exceptional student performance and academic growth, outperforming more than 80% of Idaho schools in the percentage of students meeting or exceeding proficiency in English language arts and math on the ISAT; approximately 42% of Nez Perce's students come from economically disadvantaged backgrounds. Birch Elementary School in the Vallivue School District was honored in the category of closing achievement gaps, with the school improving in the areas of English language arts and math performance of economically disadvantaged students (about 42% of their students) by 12 percentage points over the past year. They also outperformed over 90% of elementary and middle schools in the percentage of economically disadvantaged students, exceeding proficiency in the areas of English language arts and math. The Nez Perce School and Birch Elementary School will be honored during the national ESSA conference, to be held February 4-7, 2020 in Atlanta, Georgia.

Idaho also has two national nominees for a Blue Ribbon Award. Fairview Elementary in the Bonneville School District has been nominated as an exemplary high-performing school for achieving 71.9% proficiency in English language arts and 72.3% proficiency in math; more than 40% of their students come from an economically disadvantaged background. Beutler Middle School in the Westside School District was nominated for closing achievement gaps, with students achieving 74.4% proficiency in English language arts and 67.4% proficiency in math; 46% of their students come from an economically disadvantage background. The winners will be named by the USDE next September, and the winners will have the opportunity to travel to Washington, D.C. in 2020. Superintendent Ybarra publically congratulated the schools' students and educators for their hard work and continuous improvement.

Superintendent Ybarra shared that Idaho was recently named one of three states to watch in the latest “Time to Act” report from the National Data Quality Campaign (DQC). The report spotlights the Idaho State Department of Education (IDSDE) for its effectiveness in all four of the areas of the “Make Data Work for All Students” initiative, which are: Measure What Matters, Make Data Use Possible, Be Transparent & Earn Trust, and Guarantee Access & Protect Privacy. Superintendent Ybarra elaborated that Idaho was recognized for making considerable progress since the last review period, showing improvements in making the annual report card easier to navigate and offering elements like Spanish translations and performance data for new subgroups including students in military families, foster care, and homelessness. President Critchfield expressed congratulations and thanks to the IDSDE staff and the Office of the State Board of Education (OSBE) staff for their contributions and support.

Superintendent Ybarra discussed the increased emphasis on social-emotional learning, which focuses on the conditions for learning within a classroom. Idaho has been presented with the opportunity to participate in a two-year, cross-country state learning community, which was launched during the winter of 2019. The project is being led by the WestEd Center to Improve Social and Emotional Learning and School Safety. The focus of the project is improving the conditions and environment for learning in a classroom, emphasizing “whole child” initiatives within state agencies across the country. The IDSDE will receive customized support, create connections with leaders, and learn about new, innovative strategies from the field to aid in challenges with issues such as school safety.

Superintendent Ybarra attended a ceremony at the College of Western Idaho (CWI) honoring the first 15 graduates of their new Fire Service Technology certificate program. She congratulated the graduates and awarded certificates alongside Program Department Chair Kevin Platts and Nampa Fire Department Chief Kirk Carpenter. She shared that some of the graduates had just finished high school, and several of the graduates had already gone through the interview process to become firefighters within the Nampa Fire Department. Superintendent Ybarra commended CWI President Bert Glandon and the staff and faculty members at CWI who aided in creating the program. Superintendent Ybarra recently did a statewide tour to meet with legislators to discuss the 2021 budget request and priorities. She said she has had some great conversations and feels encouraged by the support of the legislators for the development and improvement of public schools.

Upon conclusion of Superintendent Ybarra’s updates, Board Member Liebich inquired about the quantity and quality of analytical data that is being collected in terms of how the IDSDE data is being used, as well as how to use the data to better engage communities. Superintendent Ybarra shared that the IDSDE monitors analytics for certain programs and the IDSDE website after receiving feedback from the public that the website was difficult to navigate, and offered to share that data with the Board if they are interested.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

2. Professional Standards Commission Annual Report

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Ybarra/Hill): I move to accept the Professional Standards Commission 2018-2019 Annual Report as submitted in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

The Professional Standards Commission (PSC) was established in Idaho Code and by the legislature during the 1970's, under authority of the Board with the IDSDE designated as the administrator. The 2018-2019 Annual Report was submitted within Attachments 1 and 2, and Lisa Colon-Durham, the Director of Certification and Director of the PSC, was present at the meeting to address questions and comments about the report and the accomplishments of the PSC over the course of the past year.

Board Member Hill mentioned the component of the report that discusses alternative authorizations, and inquired as to whether the increase of alternative authorizations during the past year is a positive thing or a negative thing. Ms. Colon-Durham stated that it can be positive or negative, and described that the increase is likely a response to the teacher shortage, as well as new information being communicated to the districts about different options for obtaining certifications.

Board Member Clark discussed the work that she and Board Member Hill have been doing as part of a Career Technical Education (CTE) workgroup, and stated that there has been confusion in the field about various ways to obtain alternative authorization. She said it is important that the Board communicates what the options are, and emphasized that additional teaching endorsements are beneficial for teachers in remote and rural districts.

Board Member Liebich inquired about the work of the PSC committee, and Ms. Colon-Durham explained that one of the items the PSC is responsible for is reviewing alternative certification routes to ensure that standards are met. She shared that the PSC recruits from the field to assist with this review of standards compliance; their findings go to the PSC Standards Committee, then to the full PSC, and then to the State Board of Education, who have the ultimate authority on program approval.

Board Member Liebich discussed the Idaho Reading Indicator (IRI) and how it has been adopted as the diagnostic tool for measuring reading proficiency, and asked whether this data could be useful in teaching future educators how to teach literacy in schools. He emphasized the importance of prioritizing improving teacher preparation in the area of literacy. Superintendent Ybarra stated that there are coaches in the areas of English language arts and math whose key focus is standards, and they are responsible for assisting K-3 teachers in becoming experts. Additionally, teachers statewide are taking a literacy course in order to remain current in terms of standards; Superintendent Ybarra added that she is also taking the course so she can be knowledgeable about the training that Idaho's teachers are receiving.

Board Member Clark stated that the Governor’s task force has engaged the provosts to examine how Idaho institutions are preparing teachers to teach reading, and engaging experts within the state to examine the process as well. There will be a report from the taskforce that will be forthcoming in order to provide recommendations for programming that will add to reading proficiency growth. Ms. Colon-Durham added that within the last two years, there has been an update to the Idaho Comprehensive Literacy Standards, and recommended that the preparation programs and taskforce should examine the standards as part of preparation programs to determine which areas need to be strengthened in order to meet proficiency goals and ensure that standards are met.

Board Member Atchley raised the issue of alternative certification methods, and inquired as to whether there is a formal process to evaluate those certifications as they compare to traditional certification methods. Tracie Bent, OSBE Chief Planning and Policy Officer, shared that the Board approved performance measures for the educator preparation programs last year, and the first year of data will be forthcoming. She stated that there are still questions about how to tie individual educators to their student level data as a way to evaluate teaching approaches and outcomes.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

3. Professional Standards Commission – American Board for Certification of Teacher Excellence (ABCTE) Educator Preparation Program Review – Review Team Report and Recommendation

BOARD ACTION

M/S (--/--): I move to accept the recommendation of the Professional Standards Commission and the 2019 ABCTE State Team Report as provided in Attachment 1.

M/S (Clark/Hill): I move to table this action with the expectation that there is a directive from the Board to the ABCTE to respond to the questions posed by the Professional Standards Commission review team. The motion carried 8-0.

Superintendent Ybarra shared that the Board has tasked the Professional Standards Commission (PSC) with reviewing and approving all teacher preparation programs, including non-traditional programs. The American Board of Certification of Teacher Excellence (ABCTE) is a Board-approved nontraditional preparation program. The review was conducted by a team of experts and the 2019 ABCTE State Team Report was approved by the full PSC during their September meeting.

Board Member Scoggin mentioned that there are several areas within the report (English, History, Literacy, and Special Education) that were not being recommended for approval and standards were not met, and inquired what the next steps would be for those programs. Ms. Colon-Durham stated that if a program is not approved, the participants currently in the program will be allowed to matriculate out, but the program

will not be permitted to admit new candidates for certification. She elaborated that participants can still use the ABCTE to add additional endorsements in those subject areas to an existing certificate, but not for their first certificate. Procedurally, the PSC notifies preparation programs on the last day of the review process if they do not meet standards, and they have the opportunity to revise a program, if needed, in order to demonstrate that they are able to meet the standards. At this time, the PSC has not received any revised programs for the American Board for the areas specified above or additional evidence showing they meet the standards.

Board Member Hill referenced Attachment 2 of the agenda materials, specifically the ABCTE report rejoinder, and inquired what their disagreement with the State review team was and how it was resolved. Ms. Colon-Durham stated that the PSC reviewed the rejoinder and that, from her perspective as a State facilitator, there was difficulty for the State review team to acquire evidence and data to inform their report. She also shared that much of the material that ABCTE has is proprietary, and that the PSC encourages the state review team to continue to request the evidence.

Board Member Hill inquired as to how many ABCTE-certified teachers are working in Idaho, and Ms. Colon-Durham stated that there are approximately 600 ABCTE-certified teachers working each year out of approximately 20,000 teachers working in Idaho. Board Member Hill inquired whether or not the failure to provide evidence as part of the ABCTE rejoinder is cause for concern.

Board Member Clark stated that she believes it is cause for concern, and that she has received comments of concern from practitioners in the field. She shared that she believes the Board needs more information before the report can be approved to ensure that educators are being properly prepared to teach. She moved that the item be tabled, and asked that Ms. Colon-Durham and the review team return to their analysis and relay to the ABCTE that the Board is requesting further supporting information prior to approving the report.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

7. Idaho State University (ISU) Proposed Endorsement Programs: Deaf/Hard of Hearing (K-12) and Family Consumer Science (6-12)

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Ybarra/Hill): I move to accept the Professional Standards Commission recommendation to conditionally approve the Deaf/Hard of Hearing (K-12) endorsement program offered through Idaho State University as submitted in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

AND

M/S (Ybarra/Hill): I move to accept the Professional Standards Commission Recommendation to conditionally approve the Family and Consumer Science (6-

12) endorsement program offered through Idaho State University as submitted in Attachment 2. The motion carried 8-0.

This item was moved from the Consent Agenda to the State Department of Education Agenda after the receipt of a written public comment the day prior to the Board Meeting.

Board Member Scoggin shared that he does not have expertise in this specific area, but that he reviewed the public comment received from a parent of 3 deaf/hard-of-hearing children. The comment expressed the need for more training for teachers to accommodate deaf and hard of hearing students, and shared that traditional training has been in American Sign Language (ASL). The deaf and hard-of-hearing endorsement program through Idaho State University (ISU) has a strong emphasis on ASL, and the public comment notes that while ASL has previously been the primary method for training, technology has modernized and has caused a shift toward auditory learning and training lending itself to Listening and Spoken Language (LSL). The comment also stated that there are only two teachers in Idaho who are certified in LSL, and that the advances in technology have presented numerous social and career opportunities for deaf and hard-of-hearing students that did not previously exist. Superintendent Ybarra, who is also the chairwoman for the Idaho School for the Deaf and Blind (ISDB), shared that the ISDB is being affected by the teacher shortage, and that the administrator of the ISDB would prefer to have this item pass than have nothing at all. She went on to say that if this motion fails, the administrator believes that it would not put the ISDB in a good position.

Board Member Scoggin inquired as to whether or not there should be a second track within the ISU program focused on LSL. Emma Wood, ISU Assistant Dean of Educator Preparation and resident expert on deaf education, shared that her team is aware of the restraint of having an undergraduate program, and mentioned that ISU previously only offered graduate-level educator programs for teachers of deaf and hard-of-hearing students. This meant that incoming students would have to already have earned a bachelor's degree in order to be accepted into the program. Moving forward, ISU has utilized the standards that ISDB has helped to define in order to create a certificate program for teachers of deaf and hard-of-hearing students, with the intention that the certificate would be paired with a primary endorsement in a core subject. Ms. Wood shared that because ASL is a specialized language that is widely-used, it is still important for teachers to have the opportunity to learn ASL. She also mentioned that the teacher should serve as the support coordinator for deaf and hard-of-hearing students in their classroom, and should work with speech pathologists and ideologists who will provide resources and services for deaf and hard-of-hearing students.

SBOE Executive Director Matt Freeman reminded the Board that they are being asked to approve the program, not the curriculum; the faculty will build the curriculum once the program has been approved. Board Member Scoggin shared his hope that students will view the program as a starting point, with the intention of continuing their studies in-depth at the graduate level. He recommended that a portion of the program should

focus on LSL, and Superintendent Ybarra stated that ISU is aware of the current student and school needs.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

INSTRUCTION, RESEARCH AND STUDENT AFFAIRS

1. Board Policy III.G. – Program Approval and Discontinuance – Second Reading

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Clark/Atchley): I move to approve the second reading of proposed amendments to Board Policy III.G., Postsecondary Program Approval and Discontinuance, as submitted in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

Jonathan Lashley, OSBE Assistant Chief Academic Officer, introduced the item and provided background information. He shared that there have been several amendments to Board Policy III.G. as a result of the first readings of this policy during the August and October 2019 Board Meetings: Institutions are to submit proposals for new academic programs in conjunction with annual budget requests when proposed programs rely on new State appropriations; baccalaureate degree programs should be reviewed and considered by the Board alongside graduate programs; letters of notification are to be provided for certificates that are 30 or fewer credits, or that require the creation of new courses; biannual reports are to be delivered to the Board regarding program changes that were approved by the Executive Director. Approval of these amendments will provide the Board with better understanding of the investments institutions are making toward new programs and offer the Board the opportunity to more effectively govern planning and delivery of new programs. Approval of the amendments will provide institutions with greater awareness of Board expectations regarding new programs and provides a formal opportunity for institutions to advocate for how new baccalaureate programs benefit students, the State, and workforce needs.

Board Member Scoggin inquired as to what the main goal or purpose of the amendments is. Board Member Clark, IRSA Committee Chair, shared that the goal of the amendments is to add approval authority for undergraduate programs, where the Board previously only had authority to approve graduate programs. The policy also allows for the Board to have authority to approve programs prior to institutions seeking funding.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

2. Military Crosswalk / Credit for Prior Learning – Information Item

This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

The Board has previously discussed topic of the Military Education Crosswalk, and this item is an opportunity to share a progress update for the program and allow the Board to ask questions. Board Member Clark introduced the item and introduced Marji Price, Project Manager for the Idaho Lumina Adult Promise initiative, who provided a summary

of the program. The goal of the program is to provide an opportunity for military veterans to earn college credit by demonstrating requisite knowledge by means of prior learning assessments (PLA). A Lumina Foundation grant was funded in October 2018, and the Board contracted with Ms. Price to develop the “crosswalks”, determining skills gained through training in various military occupations that could translate to specific general education courses. The “crosswalks” are equivalency tables that demonstrate how credit for prior learning translates to college courses. Ms. Price shared her team’s findings that are presented in the “crosswalks”, to demonstrate the relevance of skills gained in military programs as they relate to college courses: 45 military occupations relate to English education, 165 military occupations relate to public speaking, 195 military occupations relate to math, 495 occupations relate to science, 95 military occupations relate to humanities, arts, and foreign language studies, and over 500 military occupations relate to social and behavioral sciences.

The goal is to ensure that faculty and advisers statewide are aware of the program requirements in order to better serve students within the program. Beginning in January 2020 a team of 180 faculty members across the state will review curriculums to ensure that the requirements for the “crosswalk” can be met by and for incoming active duty and veteran students.

The Western Interstate Consortium on Higher Education seeks to serve active duty and veteran students, primarily the Community College of the Air Force, and Idaho will be one of the first states in the country to be able to do block transfer and acceptance for general education credits earned during military training. Ms. Price also discussed that the next generation of the Military Crosswalk will be to review 30 of the Career Technical Education (CTE) programs in order to “crosswalk” these programs with 10 of the highest-enlisted military occupations in the country. These occupations align well with several of the high-demand industries in Idaho.

Board Member Clark shared that this item was placed on the agenda because the program is on a fast track, and the intention is to have the program ready for registration prior to the fall 2020 semester. She also shared that there is great support from the Idaho Workforce Development Council. The vision for next steps with this program is that a similar opportunity will be available for all adult learners to be able to receive college credit from other areas of workforce training and prior learning. Ms. Price shared that several campuses in other states already have similar programs in place, and the grant needs to identify the work that has already been done and build upon it.

SBOE Executive Director Matt Freeman shared that Ms. Price, Jonathan Lashley, OSBE Assistant Chief Academic Officer, and Byron Yankey, OSBE College and Career Advising Program Manager, recently traveled to Denver with several Lumina grant cohort states to work on grant progress. At the meeting, Idaho was recognized as an example of best practices and as an example of what could be replicated. Senator Mike Crapo is very interested in this program.

Board Member Liebich inquired about how many college credits a typical active duty or veteran student may enter the program with, and Ms. Price shared that it is a very wide range depending on the military occupation, but the average student enters the program with 9 credits, and she has seen students enter with up to 30 credits.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

AUDIT

1. 2019 Audited Financial Statements

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Scoggin /Hill): I move to accept from the Audit Committee the Fiscal Year 2019 financial audit reports for Boise State University, Idaho State University, University of Idaho, and Lewis-Clark State College, as submitted by Moss Adams LLP in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

There were no additional comments or questions from the Board.

At this time the Board recessed for 10 minutes, returning at 10:55am.

BUSINESS AFFAIRS AND HUMAN RESOURCES

Section I – Human Resources

1. Boise State University – Creation of New Position – Vice President for Legal, Compliance and Audit

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Atchley/Clark): I move to approve the request by Boise State University to establish the Vice President for Legal, Compliance and Audit as outlined herein. The motion carried 7-0. Mr. Scoggin was absent from voting.

Board Member Liebich inquired as to why this particular role was brought before the Board for approval, and SBOE Executive Director Matt Freeman explained that Board Policy states that the Board approves the creation of any new Vice President positions, though they do not approve standing positions that are simply being rehired.

There were no additional comments or questions from the Board.

Section II – Finance

1. Idaho State University – Capital Project Bidding and Construction Phases - Davis Field

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Atchley/Hill): I move to approve the request from Idaho State University for bidding and construction for the Davis Field renovation as described herein and to authorize the Vice President for Finance and Business

Affairs to execute all necessary and requisite consulting contracts to bid, award, and complete the construction phase of the project for an amount not to exceed \$7,400,000. The motion carried 7-0. Mr. Scoggin was absent from voting.

Board Member Liebich inquired as to whether there is a certain size projects must be in order to require Board approval, and SBOE Executive Director Matt Freeman explained that projects exceeding a threshold of \$1,000,000 or issuing indebtedness trigger the need for Board approval.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

2. University of Idaho – Capital Project Planning and Design Phases – CAFE Research Dairy Facility

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Atchley/Keough): I move to approve the request by the University of Idaho to implement the Planning and Design phases of a Capital Project for the proposed Research Dairy Facility, a component of the overall CAFE Initiative, for a total cost of \$25,000,000, as described in the materials submitted to the Board. Planning and Design phase authorization is provided at \$3,500,000. Approval includes the authority to execute all necessary and requisite consulting and vendor contracts to fully implement the Planning and Design phases of the project. The motion carried 8-0.

Board Member Clark prompted the University of Idaho (UI) to juxtapose their two large projects with the public discussion of their financial situation, and how they plan to manage it. UI President C. Scott Green responded that both projects are being financed with State and private money, and will have almost no impact on the operating budget. He stated that the UI could forego either project, but would still have the same deficit; the UI has raised \$4,000,000 for the CAFE project that will have to be returned if unused. President Green shared that the UI has recently purchased the corresponding properties in Rupert and Jerome to house the project, and the sale of their Sandpoint research land and nearly completed sale of their Caldwell property has aided in paying for those purchases.

UI Vice President for Finance and Administration Brian Foisy stated that the UI has a \$10,000,000 State appropriation released by the Permanent Building Fund Advisory Council for the purposes of this project. The UI does not have any immediate cash risk with this project.

Board Member Clark shared that she has had past experience with large projects being approved and, in turn, not having funding for basic operating expenses. She emphasized the importance of being transparent and strategic about explaining the funding situation for the UI's large projects and sharing this message as widely as possible. Board Member Liebich inquired about an analysis of funding sources and what the ongoing operating statement may be once the project is completed. Board Member

Scoggin explained that those reports have been presented in previous meetings and approved through third-party contracts, and will be monitored once the project is complete. President Green added that there is a feasibility study available for the project that will be sent to the Board for their reference.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

3. University of Idaho – Capital Project Bid Award and Construction Phases – Seed Potato Germplasm Facility

BOARD ACTION:

M/S (Hill/Clark): I move to approve the request by the University of Idaho to implement the Bid, Award and Construction Phases of a Capitol Project for the proposed Seed Potato Germplasm Facility, for a total cost of \$5,200,000 as described in the materials submitted to the Board. Approval includes the authority to execute all necessary and requisite consulting and vendor contracts to fully implement the full scope of the project. The motion carried 7-0, with Mrs. Atchley abstaining.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

PLANNING, POLICY AND GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS

1. Occupational Specialist Certification Appeal

BOARD ACTION:

M/S (Hill/Atchley): I move to approve the request from the Bruneau-Grandview District to waive the education requirement, IDAPA 08.02.02.042. for the Alternative Authorization – Content Specialist for Joshua James Rishnell. Interim certification will be contingent on the applicable application being submitted and being approved by the Division of Career Technical Education during the 2019-2020 school year. The motion carried 8-0.

AND

M/S (Hill/Atchley): I move to approve the request from the Wallace School District and direct the Professional Standards Commission to waive the education requirement used for non-occupational specialist positions for Ms. Bryn Elizabeth Cotter for the 2019-2020 school year. The motion carried 8-0.

Board Member and PPGA Committee Chair introduced the item and asked that Tracie Bent, OSBE Chief Planning and Policy Officer, to give a short summary of the nature of the appeals and why the committee is recommending approval. Ms. Bent explained that there are two separate appeals within this agenda item. The first appeal is in regard to the education requirement within the alternate route to authorization for a content specialist position. The Board has authority to waive the bachelor's degree requirement for a Career Technical Education (CTE) certificate so that they may receive a

conditional three-year certificate. The second appeal is so that the individual, a CTE teacher, may apply for and receive an emergency provisional certificate.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

2. Board Policy – By-laws – First Reading

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill/Scoggin): I move to approve the first reading of Board policy – Bylaws as submitted in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

Tracie Bent, OSBE Chief Planning and Policy Officer, explained that bylaws go through two reading processes, the President's Leadership Council (PLC) provided several amendments to the bylaws, and staff have included several revisions to the Board policy should it be opened to the Board in the future. One of the key amendments is the elimination of two groups who are not currently meeting, the Athletics Committee and the Agency Heads Council. Idaho State University President Kevin Satterlee added that the amendments and revisions follow the outline of the report presented during the August 2019 Board meeting, and that the changes will help streamline efforts in how institutions submit materials to the Board.

SBOE Executive Director Matt Freeman asked Board Members to note that the PLC currently reports to the Board through the PPGA Committee, and one of the amendments shifts procedure so that the PLC reports directly to the Board.

There were no additional comments or questions from the Board.

3. Division of Career Technical Education – Program Pathways – Online Program Offerings

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill/Clark): I move to direct the Division of Career Technical Education to work with the Board staff and the Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs Committee to establish the parameters for completing the program review process and bring back a list of programs and delivery methodologies no later than the February 2020 Regular Board meeting. The motion carried 8-0.

Prior to the introduction of this item, Board President Debbie Critchfield introduced and welcomed Clay Long, the new Division of Career and Technical Education (CTE) Administrator.

Tracie Bent, OSBE Chief Planning and Policy Officer, explained that this item is a result of action that the Board took during the April 2019 Board Meeting and legislation that was passed during the last session, which requires the Division of CTE to maintain a list of programs that can be delivered online. The list stems from a Board request that programs that can be delivered online or via hybrid method be identified.

Mr. Long stated that the Division of CTE is embracing the opportunity to provide online or hybrid CTE courses, sharing that the Division has completed initial research by gather feedback from instructors in the field as to what would or wouldn't work as an online or hybrid course. Mr. Long then introduced Amy Lorenzo, Division of CTE Director of Policy and Organizational Planning, to discuss the initial research and planning that has been completed as part of this initiative.

Ms. Lorenzo shared that her team has closed the initial survey of teachers, which reached out to pathway instructors for all high school CTE programs statewide. This survey went to approximately 505 teachers and yielded a 60% response rate, and asked teachers to identify the extent to which their pathway could be taught in an online or hybrid environment. The results of the survey showed that every pathway has some level of interest in developing an online or hybrid delivery method, and that her team has identified pathways that could be delivered online as well as pathways that would be most effective when delivered via hybrid methods. The Division of CTE will focus on exploring the feasibility for online or hybrid programs in Applied Accounting, Drafting, Web Design, and Programming and Software Development. The survey also showed that any concerns about delivering programs online or via hybrid methods were less about the delivery of programs and more about whether or not students would be prepared to enter the workforce at the conclusion of their studies.

Ms. Lorenzo shared that the Division of CTE already has a partnership and structure established with Idaho Digital Learning, and CTE already offers several courses through them. This lays the foundation for hybrid delivery for many of the CTE pathways. She shared that there are several course are already live, including Computer Applications A and B, Fundamentals of Health, Medical Terminology, and Fundamentals of IT. Web Development A and B, Networking Support, and Drafting A and B will launch in January.

Ms. Lorenzo shared that the larger area of concern is the strategy for continuing to develop online and hybrid courses. The average cost for developing a course is approximately \$11,000, and the challenge is to identify a strategy for funding online course delivery in a permanent and ongoing capacity. She shared that the Division of CTE is exploring a new model for how funds are distributed for programs, online or otherwise. Applications for new pathway programs are due February 15, 2020, and instructors can propose their preference for online, hybrid, or in-person delivery, and the Division of CTE will come back to the Board for guidance once the fixed cost of program development is established.

Tracie Bent, OSBE Chief Planning and Policy Officer, stated that the requirement for the list of programs is not the approval of the specific list or program curriculum, but whether the program pathways themselves can be delivered via online or hybrid methods. The emphasis moving forward should be on standards.

Board Member Liebich shared his concerns that existing data for this initiative is from current CTE teachers, and encouraged following other states' examples that have already developed similar online and hybrid programs.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

4. Division of Career Technical Education – Perkins V Plan Update

This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Clay Long, Division of CTE Administrator, shared that Perkins V is in the planning and development stages, and that CTE will provide a draft for Board review and approval at the February 2020 Board Meeting following the conclusion of outreach efforts taking place in January. The commitment from the Division of CTE is to work with each high school to review local needs assessments and identify how to best meet their needs and requirements as they relate to Federal standards.

Board Member Clark shared that there has been negative feedback received for Perkins V, and voiced her appreciation for the Division of CTE's outreach efforts. She stated that there will be a general recommendation that the Board exercise flexibility allowed within Federal programs for the individual districts, and not impose requirements at the State level.

SBOE Executive Director Matt Freeman stated that the Perkins V draft could come before the Board as an informational item at the February 2020 Board Meeting, and then be approved at a Special Board Meeting prior to the April 1, 2020 Federal deadline. Tracie Bent, OSBE Chief Planning and Policy Officer, stated that the Board does not have to approve the draft before it goes out for public comment, but must approve the version that goes to Governor Little's office prior to the Federal deadline. Board President Critchfield confirmed that there will be a Special Board Meeting to approve the draft following the public comment period.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

5. Docket 08-0000-1900 – Summary Correction

This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Board Member Hill, PPGA Committee Chair, stated that this item corrects a typographical error in the material presented during the November 26, 2019 Special Board Meeting, which was an omnibus authorization that created pending rules. The error was regarding 12 individuals who testified in Challis, Idaho about Common Core standards; the document indicated that they were in support of the standards, but they were, in fact, against the standards.

With the updated information in mind, Board President Critchfield asked if there were any Board Members wishing to change their previous vote on this item; there were no Board Members wishing to change their previous vote.

Board Member Scoggin shared his belief that since Board Members are not able to attend all meetings across the state, it is important to receive feedback. He stated that this feedback is crucial to inform Board decisions and gauge institution performance. He shared his hope that those who are critical of the standards provide their feedback with evidence-based support for each suggested revision.

Superintendent Ybarra shared that there was an opportunity for public comment regarding Common Core when she first took office, and that each comment required specific feedback (further than “I don’t like it”). The comments were compiled and brought to the Board, and then before the legislature; there were revisions that were made in response to the comments. She added that Common Core is copywrited, and, because of the revisions that were made, the ISDE had to change the name back to Idaho Content Standards.

Board Member Liebich stated that he has heard criticism of specific parts of the curriculum among broader concerns that the standards are not working, since it appears that there are no student improvements. Superintendent Ybarra added that there are student improvements, but there are still areas that need improvement. The ISDE will share an infographic with the Board that shows student performance improvement since the implementation of the standards.

Board Member Clark stated that the alternative to standards is no standards. Board Member Atchley stated that the examples of student performance improvement discussed were in relation to graduation rates, and shared her belief that long-term results will be the telling factor.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

OTHER BUSINESS

Prior to the motion to adjourn, Board President Debbie Critchfield welcomed newly-appointed Board Member Kurt Liebich, who replaced Richard Westerberg.

There being no further business, a motion to adjourn was entertained.

M/S (Hill/Scoggin): To adjourn the meeting at 11:57am MST. The motion carried 8-0.