



STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING
Annual Board Retreat
May 11-12, 2022
Boise State University
Alumni Center
1173 University Drive
Boise, ID 83706

A regular meeting of the Idaho State Board of Education was held May 11-12, 2022 at Boise State University in Boise, Idaho. Board President Liebich presided and called the meeting to order at 12:30 p.m. (MT).

Present

Kurt Liebich, Board President	Shawn Keough
Dr. Linda Clark, Vice President	Cally J. Roach
Dr. David Hill, Secretary	Cindy Siddoway
William G. Gilbert, Jr.	Superintendent Ybarra

Absent

None

Wednesday, May 11, 2022, 12:30 p.m. (Mountain Time)

Work Session

- 1. Board Retreat – Professional Development**
 - A. America Succeeds Presentation

Tim Taylor, Co-Founder and President, America Succeeds, presented the following information concerning The High Demand for Durable Skills to the Board.

Mr. Taylor shared the following information with the Board. For the past 40 years, the primary purpose of our schools has been to maximize academic achievement. However, the world has changed. We believe the purpose of schools today is to ensure students can think critically and creatively, collaborate effectively with others, apply skills and knowledge to solving real problems, and find meaningful, fulfilling ways to contribute to the world and their community.

Our hypothesis is that every job in every sector requires Durable Skills.

Those skills are:

- **Leadership:** Directing efforts and delivering results
- **Character:** personal and professional conduct
- **Collaboration:** teamwork and connection
- **Communication:** Information exchange and management
- **Creativity:** New ideas and novel solutions
- **Critical Thinking:** Informed ideas and effective solutions
- **Metacognition:** Self-understanding and personal management
- **Mindfulness:** Interpersonal and self-awareness
- **Growth Mindset:** Improvement and aspiration
- **Fortitude:** Constitution and inspiration

America Succeeds studied 80 million U.S. job postings from the past two years; across 22 sectors and the data showed that 77% of the U.S. job postings requested at least one durable skill. It has become even more critical to ensure every individual is prepared, or upskilled, with the Durable Skills necessary for long-term success in the workforce.

Other data provided:

- ❖ There were 100 durable skills grouped into 10 competencies.
- ❖ Almost 45 million U.S. job postings requested Communication skills (or 56%).
- ❖ The top 5 durable skills were requested 4.7 times more than the top 5 hard skills.
- ❖ Seven out of the 10 most requested skills were durable skills.
- ❖ Seventy-seven percent of all U.S. job postings in the last 2 years requested at least 1 durable skill.
- ❖ Over 38 million U.S. job postings (48%) requested three durable skills.
- ❖ Of the 503,000 job postings studied in Idaho over 375,000 Idaho jobs demanded durable skills. This was across 22 occupations, 20 industries and over 11,000 companies.

Mrs. Roach asked if any states were awarding certificates for students who achieved mastery on these skills. Mr. Taylor said there is currently no certificate awarded. Organizations are beginning the discussion concerning how to determine when someone has durable skills. They are developing a rubric with this question; by what age should someone have durable skills.

Superintendent Ybarra said students have communicated with her that they want more internships and work life experiences to gain some of these durable skills. Mr. Taylor said children of privilege are getting these skills during camps and travel. If these skills were imbedded in the curriculum then all students would have a fairer chance at being exposed to these skill sets.

Dr. Clark asked about Project Based Learning or Project Lead the Way. Mr. Taylor said some of the programs are now being asked to identify which durable skill the students are learning with their programs / curriculums so it is clear which skills they are being exposed too.

Tracie Bent, Chief Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs Officer, Idaho State Board of Education said the skills identified as durable skills align with the college and career competencies the Board approved and incorporated by reference into Administrative Code the same as the subject area content standards. By law all public schools are required to teach the college and career competencies for their applicable grade ranges. The Boards Accountability Oversight Committee recently made recommendations around using the workforce readiness assessment that CTE uses to measure if students are being taught the competencies.

Board President Liebich asked if there were best practices in assessing these skills in students. Mr. Taylor said there is no comprehensive test for testing for durable skills. Community Colleges are very interested in this approach seeing it as a way to educate students with the skills that employers want. Board President Liebich mentioned the ACT work keys and wondered if that assessment could be modified to measure these skills. Mr. Taylor said they have talked to ACT, College Board and Myers Briggs, among others, and they said this was a big market but not big enough. CompTIA sells assessment software and when they saw this data they came to America Succeeds and said they would be willing to create an assessment for the workforce that can be used.

Mrs. Roach asked Dr. Clay Long if he had any thoughts on this conversation. Dr. Long, Administrator, Idaho Division of Career Technical Education, said the workplace readiness assessment they use was developed by C-Techs. Forty-seven hundred students took the assessment last year and 80% of them passed it, and those are all measured standards.

Dr. Hill made a clarifying statement; employers do not write everything they need in their job descriptions. Basing findings on just job descriptions will lead to an imperfect picture. What is almost never in a job description is good character. Dr. Hill asked if any data exists to show how the cut in funding for extracurricular activities has contributed to the lack of durable skills in our students. Dr. Clark said she wouldn't be surprised if this data would also show that the students with greater means have higher assessments over those who do not have privilege.

To Dr. Hill's point America Succeeds asked the employers who did not ask for durable skills, what can educational institutions do to help prepare students for acquiring durable skills.

Matt Freeman, Executive Director, Idaho State Board of Education asked if durable skills are native to student organizations that are part of CTE program. Dr. Long said yes. Ms. Bent said there are 4-5 states that require at least one CTE course, or a number of credits, for high school graduation.

Dr. Clark asked for the number of CTE students who were taking just one CTE course. Dr. Long said he would get that data to her after the meeting. Board President Liebich

asked if any student who took at least one CTE course took the assessment. Dr. Long said no, workplace readiness assessment is based on completing a program of study or taking at least two courses and being a senior.

Dr. Hill asked what type of requirement is there to take the test. Dr. Long said it is a timed test and students have 60 minutes to take it.

Wendi Secrist, Executive Director, Idaho Workforce Development Council, said the partnership between the Board of Education and Workforce Development to launch Next Steps / Connections is going to be an opportunity in getting employers and school districts involved. She believes we need to give our employers something actionable to do, such as how do we get more students into the workforce and how do we get employers into the classrooms. Ms. Secrist mentioned the perceived barriers to having a high school student in the workplace. The U.S. Department of Labor waives liabilities for employers who hire youth apprenticeship members. This type of communication works best from employer to employer who can tell a company how to get around the liability issues in hiring student workers. She believes when employers talk to each other they can better explain how to bring in apprenticeship students.

Mr. Freeman asked Ms. Secrist about apprenticeships and wanted an overview of where we stand on them. Ms. Secrist said we have over \$10 million dollars in funding through the U.S. Department of Labor to expand apprenticeships in Idaho. They can help any student between the ages of 16-24, in any occupation. The Idaho Department of Labor is helping to streamline this process. What used to take 6-8 months to get an apprenticeship registered now takes 6-8 weeks.

Dr. Clark said we really need to take a look at K-12 educator training standards and make sure incorporating the college and career competencies across content areas is part of the instruction. It would be helpful in training teachers to teach differently and identify where it can be done and ensuring every student receives these real-world skills.

Board President Liebich asked Mr. Taylor to bring forward to the Board any innovative policies that could benefit Idaho from his conversations with educators around the country. He also Mr. Taylor to bring the data presented today to the annual meeting of school administrators that will happen this coming August.

Mr. Taylor made a closing statement. Data has shown that those between the ages of 18-24 who lose their jobs lose it because of a lack of durable skills. This job loss can lead to a spiral in them being un or under employed for their entire careers.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

At this time the Board took a 10-minute break, returning at 1:55 p.m. (MT).

B. Emsi Burning Glass Presentation

Dr. John Barnshaw, Vice President, Educational Services and Rachel Otto, Senior Account Manager, Education Success, Universities, EMSI Burning Glass shared the following data with the Board.

- EMSI Burning Glass is headquartered in Moscow, Idaho.
- They are a leading labor market analytics company with more than 900 million job postings.
- They partner with more than 1,000 institutions of higher education in North America.

Demographic Drought – Boomers Exiting the Labor Force

- ❖ In 1997 there were 66 million boomers in the workforce and that number is now down to 41 million (2017).
- ❖ Millennials, Gen Xers, Silent/Greatest and Post-Millennial generations are not making up the difference in the workforce.
- ❖ Currently there are 11 million job openings across the country; 4 million immigration visas stuck in processing; 6 million unengaged U.S. workers.
- ❖ Immigration fell during 2020; immigration centers have not restaffed consulates making backlogs even worse and birth and unemployment rates are falling in countries we always relied upon for new workers.
- ❖ Why are workers unengaged in working? Childcare costs are more than most people make in a year; Childcare facilities struggle to fully staff their centers with qualified employees. This staffing problem directly affects the number of children they can serve. Childcare expenses can undercut the economic benefits of returning to work, especially for lower-wage workers.
- ❖ In Idaho there are over 500,000 people, over the age of 16, who are not in the labor force.
- ❖ In Idaho data from 2021 shows that:
 - Idaho's population grew by 179,527 over the last 5 years and is projected to grow by 165,690 over the next 5 years.
 - Jobs grew by 100,129 over the last 5 years and are projected to grow by 87,851 over the next 5 years.
 - Median household income is \$7.1K below the national median household income of \$62.8K.
 - Some of the fastest growing populations in Idaho are the white Hispanic population which is expected to rise by 38% to almost a quarter million people.
 - The population of those who identify with two or more races, plus non-Hispanic, is slated to grow by 68%.
 - Six percent of people with a college degree work from home and that number is increasing.

Retaining Talent in Idaho

- ❖ Approximately 15 percent of students attending Idaho public colleges and universities are from out-of-state.
- ❖ Many more would have left the state had it not been for Idaho public colleges and universities pricing.
- ❖ In 2021, the expenditures of relocated and retained students added \$170.7 million for the Idaho economy which supported 4,084 jobs.

This data is important for a Higher Education strategy. This data helps Idaho institutions set out of state tuition prices. They look at how much it costs for in-state tuition for those in other states and target those populations with more attractive tuition pricing.

Looking at the states where students come from to attend Idaho's Universities we see the majority of students are Idaho natives. However, students are also coming from Washington, California, Oregon and Utah.

Board President Liebich asked how these retention numbers compare with other state education systems. Ms. Otto said a review of the data shows Idaho universities maintain 60-70% retention of these alum.

CTE, Microcredentials, Skill Pathways

Fastest Growing Industries in Idaho 2018-2020

- Health Care and Social Assistance
- Manufacturing
- Professional, Scientific and Tech
- Project Management Specialists and Business Operations had a 47% increase in occupations with median hourly earnings of \$34.87 an hour.
- Software Developers increased 35% with an hourly wage of \$44.11.

Further review of the data shows that relying just on high school graduates to increase enrollment numbers for Idaho universities will not work because the population growth is not matching those projected student growth numbers. What will have to happen is to reach out to adults already in the workforce and to cycle them in and out of education over their lifetimes.

Microcredentials are short, focused credentials designed to provide in-demand skills, know-how and experience. Stackable microcredentials can also provide a pathway to a certificate or full degree, now or when you are ready.

Demonstrating Value to the Public

- ❖ Sixty-one percent of adults believe higher education is going in the wrong direction.
- ❖ Thirty-four percent of undergraduates strongly agree that they will graduate with the job market skills they need.

- ❖ Eleven percent of business leaders strongly agree that graduating students have the skills their businesses need.
- ❖ Eighty-three percent of first-year students attend college to be able to get a better job.
- ❖ Eighty-three percent of graduated students believe their higher education degree did lead to a meaningful career path.

Dr. Clark asked for more insight into the statement of the institutions redefining student success. Ms. Otto said students when they graduate do not feel that graduation is the end goal but they are thinking about career paths and lifelong career transitions. And perhaps what other types of learning will be in their future for them to advance in their careers.

Mrs. Keough said what does the current academic alignment verses industry needs mean. Dr. Barnshaw said it means a healthy program mix. He looks for the following three things: Is there internal demand for students to go through a program; is there an external demand component that aligns with the labor market; are we delivering quality instruction that aligns with the above.

Mrs. Roach said so much of Idaho is rural and how do we reach out to them. There are jobs in rural communities but how do we engage with those seeking jobs through education. Dr. Barnshaw said many states are grappling with the challenge of getting those in rural areas connected. Ms. Otto said many of the Hispanics in rural areas would be first-generation students to higher education. Exploring their needs directly could be beneficial.

Ms. Secrist mentioned the Idaho Launch program (<https://idaholaunch.com/>). Fifty million in funding was received from ARPA funding to invest in workforce training over the next 10 years. Workforce Development surveyed employers across industries to find out what skills they expect to hire for in the near future. And to find out which skills employers are looking to hire for in the region. Using some of the data that comes from EMSI Burning Glass and data from Idaho's labor market they looked at companies that have more than 150 job openings or more per year.

Dr. Hill asked will the Launch Program be offering certificate programs. Ms. Secrist said yes, that is what they will be reviewing. Dr. Hill mentioned the problem with financial aid and certificates. Ms. Secrist said that has always been the intention of Launch; to fill the gap where financial aid can't.

Dr. Clark asked how is Launch working with teachers. Ms. Secrist said Launch is hoping to pay tuition for teachers when they are doing their student teaching. Dr. Clark offered to meet with Ms. Secrist to discuss ways to help with teacher retention or incentives. The districts are reporting an onslaught of teacher retirements and Idaho is not going to be able to fill thousands of teacher's jobs.

Ms. Secrist said she would like to come to the Board over the summer when the survey data is complete showing what Idaho's business owners are looking for.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

At this time the Board took a 10-minute break returning at 3:15 p.m.

C. Institution Business Models and
D. Higher Education Strategic Conversation

Dr. Hill led the discussion. What concerns him is that every institution forecasts student enrollment being on the increase but he said that cannot be sustained, especially with the declining birth rate.

Dr. Cathleen McHugh, Chief Research Officer, Idaho State Board of Education did an analysis on the Idaho birth rate. Her data showed that:

- ❖ During the last recession the birth rate in Idaho dropped more than the national average.
- ❖ Idaho's population has gotten older which can explain some of this declining birth data.
- ❖ Of those who are of peak child bearing years data shows they are having less children.
- ❖ Enrollment data increases are coming from people moving into the state, not from a rise in the birth rate.
- ❖ The Idaho Department of Labor does population projections and for those aged 15-19 they are projecting a 7% increase in population from 2019-2029.
- ❖ For the states which send Idaho students (Washington, California, Oregon, Utah) only two of those states are projected to have a population growth; one state stays flat and one sees a population decrease.

Dr. Hill said BSU draws heavily from white students from Southern California and that is a declining population. Dr. Hill opined where is the Boards responsibility and the institutional responsibility on this issue.

Board President Liebich said at a Board level the Board needs to focus on getting the message out that obtaining a higher education degree is valuable; how do you retain the students we have; how do we think about education and make it less about the degree and more about skill set. Every institution, in trying to attract new students, will try to come up with new programs whether it be getting an associate's degree at a 4-year institution or a 2-year institution wanting to offer a Bachelor's degree.

Dr. Hill finds that what works well is managed competition which has yet to be defined. Mr. Gilbert agreed and wondered if treating all of the schools the same was part of the problem since they are not all the same. A review of what the institutions do well, and

what they are capable of, would need to be done in order to come up with managed competition. That discussion has never really taken place.

Board President Liebich asked for more of the history on this issue. Mr. Gilbert said 20 years ago all of the institutions were told not to compare programs so they responded to incentives that were put in front of them by the Board of Education. They were told to grow their enrollment and make it work. It would take a lot of discussion and several years to foster the changes that need to be made. He further said that the tone has changed. There is more collaboration between the institutions and the Board is different.

Dr. Clark said even a few years ago there would have been shock to hear that students can take courses from multiple institution's and get their degree.

Mrs. Roach brought up the nursing program that is offered by ISU + BSU. Mr. Gilbert said the question should be asked if Idaho has the most efficient mechanize for delivering nursing education in the state of Idaho.

Dr. Hill said each college has a different code for the exact same class. When the Board tried to get them to use a common numbering system they reacted like they were asked to overthrow the government. Dr. Clark said 10 years ago ISU could not deliver English to Renaissance High School students because they did not have the authority to deliver English in Meridian. Idaho has come a long way.

Dr. Hill said with the advent of On-Line Idaho across the state and with the delivery of GEM courses it should enable strategic specialization. He further said to pilot this discussion he believes we need a statewide approach to engineering. Not one of our institutions is a top ranked engineering school, but as a state, and if they worked together, they can deliver that degree. The same approach can be taken with nursing and teacher education.

Mrs. Roach asked the question about why does each institution have their own enrollment and retention software and is it necessary. She also asked for rural education outreach and if there is a best in class approach.

Mrs. Keough said enrollment and the go-on rates coupled with what the business community say they need should be the drivers for system change.

Dr. Hill and Mr. Gilbert brought up the issue of courses being brought forward by three different institutions building three different programs around cyber security. The Board has no idea if these programs are complimentary or competing. Dr. Hill thinks an outside entity should be brought in to review these programs to see if they are complimentary or competing. What is needed is a statewide leader to bring everything into focus.

Mr. Freeman mentioned the \$100,000 given to the Board of Education by the Legislature to develop a plan for building out engineering and that Scott Greco, Deputy Director, Idaho State Board of Education will be meeting with the Deans of the Colleges of Engineering and their industry advisory groups. Dr. Hill said he could help with that meeting.

Dr. Hill said how will the legislation be written to support the statewide program. Where is the expertise in doing that. Dr. Clark seconded the notion of bringing in an outside person to look at where each institution is now and how do we get back on track to the Board's original notion of a shared combined program. She does not believe that can be done internally. Mr. Freeman said with an aggressive timeline the Board can form the budget request for next legislative session.

Gideon Tolman, Chief Financial Officer, Idaho State Board of Education, asked for direction. Several of the institutions were writing up something now on cybersecurity and should they be told to place those plans on hold. Dr. Hill said to let them proceed and then see what they come up with.

Mrs. Keough said the Board will most likely have to narrow the institution's missions down as we progress in this effort so there is clear delineation between the institution's and what their missions are and aren't.

Dr. Hill said the Board also needs to understand what ERP convergence is and what it means. Does it mean everyone uses the same software, or are they interoperable, or do they use the same student information system. He further believes this topic should fall to the Business, Affairs and Human Resources Committee for further discussion. Mr. Gilbert asked if the Board office has the resources to begin even scoping out the definitions of ERP. Mr. Freeman said the Board office did get \$1 million dollars this year for ERP convergence but we would have to engage consultants to work on this program. But an answer to this question has to happen first; do you want to move to one platform or do the four separate University platforms talk to each other to get the data.

Dr. Clark asked what data do we need that we don't have. Mr. Gilbert said the questions should include;

1. What are the relative costs of each system.
2. How are the renewals done.
3. What are each of the systems.
4. On a per pupil basis what do the costs look like.
5. What technology programs are being utilized and how do they communicate.

Mr. Gilbert mentioned another topic for discussion concerning the two-year colleges which want to offer 4-year education. The Board has to have a proactive perspective on this issue.

Mrs. Roach said down in southern Idaho there is a need for more teacher education at a Bachelor's level and it has not been delivered. Dr. Clark said when the Board denied the request by CSI it was because there were assurances made by ISU that they would deliver the needed education. She thinks ISU should be asked to give us an update on their progress on making good on their commitment to providing those courses.

Mrs. Roach mentioned how short handed the high schools were in career advising and wondered if the colleges could help with this short fall. It was disclosed that College of Southern Idaho, Lewis-Clark State College and North Idaho College already offer this support.

Mrs. Keough mentioned SB 1374 regarding career pathways that did not pass the House. Ms. Bent said last year the Board did include as part of the negotiated rule making a requirement for middle schools to provide instruction to students on career pathways. This requirement took effect in March 2022.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

Superintendent Ybarra left the meeting at 4:40 p.m. (MT).

EXECUTIVE SESSION (Closed to the Public) – Action Item

1. To go into Executive Session pursuant to Section 74-206(1)(b), Idaho Code to consider the evaluation, dismissal or disciplining of...a public officer, employee, staff member or individual agent, or public-school student.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill / Roach): I move to go into Executive Session pursuant to Section 74-206(1)(b), Idaho Code, to consider the evaluation, dismissal or disciplining of...a public officer, employee, staff member or individual agent, or public-school student. A roll call vote was taken and motion carried 7-0. Superintendent Ybarra was absent from voting.

The Board entered into Executive Session at 4:42 p.m. (MT)

The Board recessed at 6:00 p.m. (MT)

Thursday, May 12, 2022 – 9:15 a.m. (Mountain Time)

EXECUTIVE SESSION (Closed to the Public - Continued) – Action Item

1. To go into Executive Session pursuant to Section 74-206(1)(b), Idaho Code to consider the evaluation, dismissal or disciplining of...a public officer, employee, staff member or individual agent, or public-school student.

Board Members entered into Executive Session at 9:15 a.m. (MT). The Board convened in Executive Session to consider an exempt matter, which is permissible under Open

Meeting Law, Idaho Code, Title 74, Section 206(1)(b). The Board concluded its discussion and took no action on the matter discussed. If action is necessary in these matters it will occur at a future meeting properly noticed under the Open Meeting Law.

BOARD ACTION M/S (Hill / Siddoway): I move to go out of Executive Session. The motion carried 7-0. Superintendent Ybarra was absent from voting.

Board Members exited Executive Session at 2:25 p.m. (MT), effectively adjourning the meeting.