



**IDAHO STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING**  
**February 15-16, 2023**  
**Boise State University**  
**Simplot Ballroom**  
**1700 W University Drive**  
**Boise, ID 83725**

A regular meeting of the Idaho State Board of Education was held at Boise State University February 15-16, 2023. Board President Kurt Liebich presided and called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m. (MT).

**Present**

**Kurt Liebich, President**  
**Dr. Linda Clark, Vice-President**  
**Dr. David Hill, Secretary**  
**Shawn Keough**

**Cally Roach**  
**Cindy Siddoway**  
**William G. Gilbert, Jr.**  
**Superintendent Debbie Critchfield**

**Absent**

None

**Wednesday, February 15, 2023 – 1:00 p.m. (MT)**

Prior to the start of the official meeting Board President Liebich welcomed Superintendent Critchfield back to the Board. Superintendent Critchfield said it was exciting to be back on the Board and to be back among familiar faces and new friends. She quickly outlined some of her priorities for the next four years. Each of these items can be grouped into two categories; student growth and achievement, and preparation.

To achieve these goals, she and her team will focus on:

1. An investment in literacy training including dyslexia training.
2. Foundational Math work expansion and strengthening career technical education offerings.
3. Initiation of a discussion to review High School graduation requirements.
4. Developing regional support centers catering to the specific needs of the students in each area.
5. Developing a working group to create behavioral health programs for students.
6. Initiate curriculum review.
7. Support the needs of parents whether its via school choice, or navigating issues they are having with their local school Boards.

Board President Liebich said the Board is looking forward to helping the Superintendent move along her agenda.



## **BOARDWORK**

1. Agenda Review and Approval – Action Item

## **BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Keough) I move to approve the agenda as posted.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

2. Minutes Review and Approval – Action Item

## **BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Roach) I move to approve the minutes for the December 21, 2022 Regular Board Meeting.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

3. Rolling Calendar – Action Item

## **BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to set February 21 - 22, 2024 as the date and Boise State University as the location for the February 2024 regularly scheduled Board meeting.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

A discussion ensued about moving the February 2024 Board meeting to a later time to accommodate for Board members schedules. A new motion was made.

**M/S (Hill / Roach) I move to set February 27-28, 2024 as the date and Boise State University as the location for the February 2024 regularly scheduled Board meeting.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

## **CONSENT**

### **BAHR**

1. Boise State University – Multi-Year Employment Agreements – Men’s Football Defensive and Offensive Coordinators – Action Item

## **BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the request by Boise State University to enter into an employment agreement with Spencer Danielson, Defensive Coordinator for its football team, as presented in the attached documents.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

## **AND**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the request by Boise State University to enter into an employment agreement with Bush Hamdan as Offensive Coordinator for**



**its football team, as presented in the attached documents.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

2. Boise State University – Oracle HCM Contract Renewal – Action Item

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve Boise State University’s request to approve the renewal of its Human Capital Management cloud system with Oracle America, Inc. as outlined herein.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

3. Boise State University – Student Union Building Fire Alarm – Action Item

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the request by Boise State University to upgrade the fire alarm system and panel in the Student Union Building for an amount not to exceed \$1.75 million dollars.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

4. Boise State University – Auxiliary Gymnasium Remodel in Extra Mile Arena – Action Item

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the request by Boise State University to proceed with planning and design for \$700,000 for the Auxiliary Gymnasium Renovation project and to issue a RFQ for design-build or for design services subject to discussions with DPW.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

5. Boise State University – Online Program Fees – Cryptology Security Analyst Graduate Certificate, Project Management Undergraduate Certificate, and Social Media Creator Undergraduate Certificate – Action Item

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the request by Boise State University to charge online program fees of \$525 per credit for a Graduate Certificate in Cryptology Security Analyst, and \$350 per credit for Undergraduate Certificates in Project Management and Social Media Creator.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

6. Idaho State University – Multi-Year Employment Agreement – Men’s Head Football Coach – Action Item



### **BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the request by Idaho State University to enter into a five (5) employment agreement with Cody Hawkins, Head Football Coach, commencing on February 20, 2023 and terminating on January 21, 2028, at a base salary of \$210,000 and supplemental compensation provisions, as submitted. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.**

7. Idaho State University – Online Program Fee – Industrial Cybersecurity Engineering Technology Apprenticeship Program and Professional Fee – Graduate Certificate in Nursing Education – Action Item

### **BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the request by Idaho State University to implement an online program fee of \$350 per credit for the Industrial Cybersecurity Engineering Technology Apprenticeship program, and \$120 per credit professional fee, in addition to the normal tuition, for a new Graduate Certificate in Nursing Education, in conformance with the program budgets submitted to the Board in Attachments 1 and 2. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.**

### **IRSA**

8. General Education Matriculation Committee Appointments – Action Item

### **BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to appoint Jacob Haerberle, representing the College of Eastern Idaho, to the General Education Matriculation Committee, effective immediately. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.**

### **PPGA**

9. Indian Education Committee Appointments – Action Item

### **BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to appoint Ms. Gail Ballard, representing North Idaho College to the Idaho Indian Education Committee effective February 15, 2023 and expiring June 30, 2027. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.**

10. University of Idaho – Facilities Naming – Action Item

### **BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the request by the University of Idaho to name the Idaho Asia Institute “The Habib Idaho Asia Institute” and authorize the President of the University of Idaho, or the President’s designee, to execute the**



**agreement and any related transactional documents.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

11. STEM Action Center – STEM School Designation – Action Item

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the request by the STEM Action Center to designate Project Impact STEM Academy #513 as a Designated STEM School for 2023-2027.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

**AND**

**I move to approve the request by the STEM Action Center to designate Columbia High School in Nampa School District #131 as a Designated STEM School for 2022-2026.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

**AND**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the request by the STEM Action Center to designate Ernest Hemingway STEAM School in Blaine County School District #61 as a Designated STEM School for 2022-2026.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

**AND**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the request by the STEM Action Center to designate JR Simplot Elementary School in American Falls School District #381 as a Designated STEM School for 2022-2026.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

**AND**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the request by the STEM Action Center to designate Fernan STEM Academy in Coeur d’Alene School District # 271 as a Designated STEM School for 2022-2026.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

**SDE**

12. Professional Standards Commission Appointments – Action Item

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to appoint Ryan Cantrell to the Professional Standards Commission for a partial term beginning immediately and ending June 30, 2026,**



representing the State Department of Education. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

13. Emergency Provisional Certificates – Action Item

**BOARD ACTIONS**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the request by the State Department of Education for one-year emergency provisional certificates in the Instructional and career technical education certificates with endorsement area(s) at the specified school districts as provided herein for the 2022-2023 school year for the following individuals: Claudio Pinto, Matthew Hansen, Brian Bell, Chelsey Day, Avery Harrison, Laurie Merchant, Kaitlyn Hill, John Sowell, Brooke Anhder, Sierra Hocklander, Reena Forsman, Edward Simmons, McKayla McAuley, Kristipher Buchanan, Michael Majors, Lori Norman, Alissa Rodriguez, Austin Hall, Deven Maddy, Tara Jolly, Evonne McGuire, Molly Alles, Lori Erickson, Tiffany Harrison, Jace Thompson, Kelly Culver, Derinda Johnson. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.**

**AND**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the request by State Department of Education for one-year emergency provisional certificates in the School Counselor and School Psychologist, endorsement area at the specified school districts as provided herein for the 2022-2023 school year for the following individuals: Cody Custer, Abigail Lawton, Gabrielle Nash. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.**

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the consent agenda. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.**

**BOARD OF TRUSTEES – BOISE STATE UNIVERSITY**

1. Boise State University Students

The following students addressed the Board; Mariette Barcinas, Mandy Snowden-Edmonds, Sarah Carson, Sabrina Mead, Ryan Bernard, Adam Jones and Serena Henry.

Dr. Hill asked if any of the students did internships and he wondered if they helped or didn't help with their academic experience.

Two of the students said working in the Idaho Legislature as an intern was helpful in learning more about how the Idaho political landscape works. The rest of the students



shared that they did internships in such diverse areas such as the US Airforce, Graduate Research Assistant in Infant Biometrics, Bronco Corp (a paid internship program coordinated by the College of Business and Economics), non-profit foundations, extended studies, and even the Idaho State Board of Education working for the Academic Affairs office.

Mrs. Roach asked the students about college affordability and if they were getting help with their financial obligation while earning their higher education degree.

The students shared that they have applied for scholarships and student loans due to the rising costs of education and the rising cost of living. The students are also working on campus to help defray costs. One student shared that she was homeless prior to applying to BSU and she felt that there were additional hurdles she needed to address to complete the enrollment paperwork, so she started college a year later than she would have wanted.

Dr. Clark asked the Idaho students if they participated in the dual credit program as part of their high school experience and if so what impact did that have as they matriculated to Boise State.

The students shared the following; by the time one student had completed high school she had also completed a year and a half of her psychology bachelor's degree and it made her college workload easier so that she could work a campus job and participate in extracurricular activities. One student took both AP and dual credit courses but she did not see any advantage to taking either since they were not applicable to the program she entered at BSU, so it still took her four years to complete her degree. One student shared that what taking dual credit courses did for him was to prepare him for what being in college would be like.

Board President Liebich asked those who graduated from Idaho High Schools if they felt academically prepared to enter college.

The students said they wish they had been better prepared as to the demands of the college experience especially as it pertains to the turning in of assignments and even test taking. What happens in high school is not what happens in a college classroom and that was a real wake up call. They also shared that the application process and the student loan process were complicated and they were unprepared for that. One student was a member of her schools Trio program which prepared her for applying for school and student loans so she felt better prepared than most.

Superintendent Critchfield asked if the students were in a room full of high school freshman what advice would they give them, as experienced as they are now.





The students said they would share the following; take advantage of all of the resources on campus which are available to you such as using the writing center and shuttle service; explore your options, check out multiple internships and take courses to

broaden your horizon, this may lead to a change in your career aspirations. One student shared that she helped to develop a club for disabled students as there wasn't one on campus when she arrived but it took her three years to learn that she could start a club. The students said to get involved in student government or clubs or sororities early in the process which will give you more opportunities and the ability to meet more students. And lastly, communicate early and often with the instructors. Building these types of relationships will help you learn who to have in your support system.

Board President Liebich said a current narrative circulating in the press is that higher education isn't worth the financial investment. He asked the students to share their perspective on this issue.

The students said no education is wasted and they have more options and opportunities available to them with their degree, then without. One student shared that she has friends who left Idaho to get their higher education degree, which they are paying more for, and they have the same opportunities in front of them, so she was glad she stayed in Idaho where education is more affordable.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

## 2. Boise State University Employees address the Board

The following faculty members addressed the Board; John Hawbaker, Interim Director, Veterans Services; Kelly Talbert, Executive Director, Admissions & New Student Programs; Kelly Myers, Associate Dean, College of Arts and Sciences; Peter Risse, Associate Dean, Extended Studies; Andrew Finstuen, Dean of the Honors College and Associate Vice President for Strategic Planning and Special Initiatives at Boise State University; Angie Phillips, Program Director & Clinical Asst. Professor, Nursing Department, College of Health Sciences; Megan Koster, Department Chair, Clinical Associate Professor, Master's Program Director, Department of Respiratory Care, College of Health Sciences.

Mr. Gilbert asked the instructors to give their perspectives into why funding education matters.

The faculty said the ability to reallocate funding to certain programs has been helpful. The ability to fund programs to ensure they can be successful, prior to asking for long term funding is invaluable. Everything being done today to make students successful in the work force makes education spending incredibly important. It cannot be stressed





enough how important this investment in student outcomes is. The students have also shared what they dream their education will do for them in the future, and the support they receive during their time at BSU helps to shape their narrative and show them new ways to achieve their goals.

Mrs. Roach asked how, or if, they interacted with the employers and companies in the state and how do they direct students to those companies.

The nursing students interact in a clinical setting with most of the health care partners in the state. Nursing programs are developed by nurses which leads to a higher competency rate for nursing students. There is direct engagement with Micron and Amazon to prepare students for a role working for either company.

Dr. Hill asked what questions arise from first year students during orientation.

Ms. Talbert said first generation students are often daunted by the entire college process from getting enrolled, onboarding, receiving counseling, and navigating campus life.

Dr. Hill asked if we were serving Idaho Veterans well.

Mr. Hawbaker said he believed so. There is a system in place to help veteran students with housing, tuition and fees and putting them in touch with services available to veteran students from across Idaho. The teachers also disclosed that BSU is the only Idaho institution which is a member of a baccalaureate consortium which means veterans can take their credits with them when they transfer.

Dr. Clark asked if our veterans are getting full credit for prior learning as they come into Idaho institutions.

BSU is working with veterans to get college credit for previous college level learning. The statistic shared with the Board was that of those students who were given credit for all prior learning, not only are they are being retained at 100 percent, but they have all graduated with a degree.

Board President Liebich asked if the instructors were seeing any learning gaps as it pertains to the fallout from the pandemic.

Some of what the instructors have seen is that the students have underdeveloped socialization skills and have trouble interacting and communicating with others. There is also a noticeable increase in mental health struggles and campus resources are being utilized to help with this problem.



Mrs. Roach thanked everyone for their continued efforts in reaching out to students in rural areas who cannot get into Boise to take in-person classes and she wondered what else could be done to get more non-traditional students enrolled.

The instructors agreed that it was important to find ways to let students learn and work in the community's they lived in. Therefore, community outreach is ongoing in rural areas throughout Idaho. Employers in rural areas also need to show up for these students in order to place them in good jobs within their own communities.

Board President Liebich asked what the morale was like on campus.

The teachers said using the strategic plan helped with lifting morale during the pandemic. While many of the support staff and faculty are exhausted due to the increased demands from the pandemic everyone still continues to help students with their needs. Retaining and attracting good new talent is also challenging in this current economic climate.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

At this time the Board took a 12-minute break, returning at 2:30 p.m. (MT).

## **PLANNING, POLICY AND GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS**

### **1. Boise State University Annual Report – Information Item**

Dr. Marlene Tromp, President, Boise State University, gave the annual report to the Board sharing the following highlights.

- BSU has had a 29 percent increase in 6-year graduation rates; a 44 percent increase in 4-year graduation rates; a 21 percent increase in research awards, a 79 percent increase in online enrollment and a 41 percent increase in philanthropy from FY 21 to FY 22.
- BSU serves more than 32,000 students annually, granting more than 5,300 degrees a year. BSU awards more college degrees than any other public institution in Idaho and awards more bachelor's degrees than all other Idaho public universities combined.
- Idaho student enrollment increased by 20 percent just this past year.
- BSU has collaboration agreements with all Idaho institutions offering degrees in various programs such as Cybersecurity degrees, Idaho Science and Technology Policy Fellowships and a graduate certificate in Nuclear Security and Safeguards.
- There are currently 5,428 students accessing BSU's online programming which is an 80 percent increase within just the last 5 years.



- BSU has 1,831 veteran students; which represents 80 percent of all Idaho veterans currently serving active duty, national guard and reserve military students; 4 times more than all of Idaho's other public institutions combined.
- BSU has the highest academic performance among student athletes. Many of BSU's donors first donate to the athletic program.
- BSU has become Idaho's largest graduate school with the addition of nine new doctoral programs in a decade.
- STEM degrees are up 40 percent since 2014.
- BSU's research awards are in such areas as quantum DNA research, Cancer research, cybersecurity and sagebrush research. BSU has received \$68 million in research awards, which is a 21 percent increase over the last 5 years. Students earn academic credits working alongside faculty on these research programs, a rarity among research institutions in the country.
- BSU has 167,000 living alumni; 84 percent of 2021-2022 graduates say their job is related to their degree; 74 percent of the 2021-2022 bachelor degree graduates are working in Idaho.
- BSU has the 7th lowest tuition in the country. Forty-five percent of BSU student's graduate without incurring any student loan debt.
- The True-Blue Promise Scholarship is for Idaho students. BSU is projecting they will award 1.8 million in scholarships over the next few years.

Mrs. Roach asked how is BSU able to get 45 percent of their students to graduate without any debt. Dr. Tromp said BSU does an excellent job in making sure the students know what scholarships and what work study programs are available to them.

Mr. Gilbert asked about the changes to BSU's leadership team and he wondered where things stood on that issue. Dr. Tromp said the only position that still needs to be filled is Chief Financial Officer. BSU was able to recruit amazing candidates for top management positions based on BSU's mission, and the ability to relocate to Boise.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

## **BUSINESS AFFAIRS AND HUMAN RESOURCES**

### **1. University of Idaho – Utility Public Private Partnerships Update**

Lee Espey, Divisions Operation Officer; Brian Foisy, VP of Finance; and Linda Campos, Associate VP of Finance, University of Idaho, gave the presentation.

Mr. Foisy began by reviewing the P3 partnership. On November 2, 2020, the U of I's Board of Regents approved a 50-year public private partnership (P3), to lease the University's utility system to Sacyr/Plenary (Concessionaire), and grant it the exclusive right to operating the utility system and provide utility services to the University of Idaho



campus. Providing an annual report to the Board of Education was part of the partnership agreement paperwork.

- The 50-year lease of utility system assets is used to generate cash flow for core operations through investment of the \$188 million upfront consideration (Net of bond defeasance and transaction costs).
- At least \$6 million is invested annually in revenue generating strategic initiatives throughout the life of the partnership.
- Some of the capital improvements are the McClure Chiller Improvement which supplies cool water all year long. And the Kibbie Dome Electrical System Replacement program which will be used to replace transformers which are 25 years past their useful life.
- Unplanned outages have occurred since the partnership began such as the transformers failing at the Kibbie Dome right before homecoming, and the concessionaire was able to provide generators so that the festivities could continue.
- The Concession Agreement is very strong but changes / amendments will be brought to the Board's attention. One of the issues that will be brought forward is that the partners are not able to get property insurance for some of the assets which are their responsibility. UI has partnered with State Risk to cover some of those assets; but still there are assets they cannot get coverage for and UI will bring that information back to the Board at a future meeting.
- When this program came before the Board initial modeling reflected positive cash flow over the 50-year agreement of at least \$350 million and up to \$1.1 billion.
- The Strategic Initiatives Fund (SIF) is a single-purpose 501(c)(3) that invests, manages, and distributes the net closing proceeds from the P3 transaction. The SIF Board is composed of Board President Liebich, Representative Lori McCann and CFO of the University of Idaho, Brian Foisy. Their directive is to develop investment and spending policies to achieve the maximum value to current and future beneficiaries over the 50 years of the partnership agreement.
- Investments are being used to target three strategic initiatives; student success, research and R1 Goals and Telling Our Story. To that end UI can report the following:
  - ❖ Total enrollment is up 6.6 percent.
  - ❖ Auxiliary revenue growth of 9.1M.
  - ❖ Tuition revenue growth of \$5M.
  - ❖ Largest freshman class in history.
  - ❖ On-campus housing is up 19 percent.

Mr. Gilbert asked how much of the assets were uninsured. Mr. Espey said it was \$30 million dollars. Mrs. Roach asked if UI was able to purchase stop loss insurance on the uninsured portion of the assets. Mr. Espey said they were not.



Mr. Gilbert asked if UI had the opportunity to share these outcomes with Legislators during this past legislative session. Mr. Foisy said no formal presentation has been made but Representative McCann does sit on the SIF Board of Directors. Mr. Gilbert thought getting this data before the Legislators would be beneficial in showing its efficiency to the state taxpayer. He further said, since this is a metrics-based program giving the Legislators these projections would be powerful.

Dr. Clark said when this program was proposed it was said that the fees collected would be the measure of success, as the earned money would be used to invest in student success and research. Is the list of student outcomes presented here today the full list of those metrics? Mr. Foisy said no, there are many other performance indicators, this was just a small sample of the types of metrics being used for this program.

Dr. Hill asked what happens if UI reaches capacity limits which will require capital investments and where does that investment come from. Mr. Foisy said UI is working on a second public-private partnership that centers around student housing to expand housing on campus.

Mrs. Siddoway asked if this partnership model was unique to the University of Idaho or is it used broadly across the country. Mr. Foisy said this is not unique to the UI but they are one of only three institutions in the nation who have entered into a public-private partnership such as this one centered around utilities. The more common partnerships deal with student housing.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

## **INSTRUCTION, RESEARCH AND STUDENT AFFAIRS**

### **1. Board Policy III.M. – Public Postsecondary Accreditation – First Reading**

Mrs. Roach said there was a minor change that needed to be made to Policy III. M. Dr. TJ Bliss, Chief Academic Affairs Officer, Idaho State Board of Education, said the policy currently states that all eight institutions shall “be evaluated” by NWCCU based on a seven-year accreditation cycle. The proposed change will clarify the long-standing intent of this policy that institutions shall “be accredited” by NWCCU and “evaluated” on a seven-year accreditation cycle. This was a first reading.

## **BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Roach / Keough) I move to approve the first reading of Board Policy III.M., Public Postsecondary Accreditation as submitted in Attachment 1. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.**

There were no comments or questions from the Board.



## 2. Board Policy III.N. – Statewide General Education – Second Reading

Dr. Bliss said this was a second reading and there were no comments received between first and second reading. Just a reminder that the changes were:

- ❖ Change the Oral Communication minimum requirement of the general education framework from two (2) credits to three (3).
- ❖ Change the institutionally-designated minimum requirement of the general education framework from six (6) credits to five (5).
- ❖ Remove a diagram that is no longer necessary.

### **BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Roach / Clark) I move to approve the second reading of proposed amendments to Board Policy III.N., Statewide General Education, as submitted in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

The Board recessed for the evening at 4:08 p.m. (MT).

**Thursday, February 16, 2023 – 8:00 a.m. (MT)**

### **INSTRUCTION, RESEARCH AND STUDENT AFFAIRS**

#### 3. Graduate Medical Education Strategic Plan Updates

Dr. Epperly, Chairman of the Graduate Medical Education committee, shared the following with the Board.

The Idaho Ten-Year GME Strategic Plan is in its fifth year and has been very successful in meeting its purpose and vision. The Plan has been widely accepted by Idaho policymakers as the blueprint for strategic investment in expanding the state's physician workforce. In just five years, the Plan has grown new GME (residency) programs from nine to 13 (45% increase), new fellowship programs from four to ten (150% increase) and has also expanded the number of residents and fellows in training each year from 134 to 243 (81% increase). This Midpoint Update to the Ten-Year GME Strategic Plan was unanimously approved by the Board's GME Committee on January 9, 2023.

Dr. Epperly reminded those in attendance that the pipeline to become a physician is very long. A student begins with a regular college degree; progresses to a four-year medical degree and then does their residency which can be anywhere from three to seven years. Additional fellowship training would happen after that and can be one to three years. The update being presented today shows the gains made in recruiting and retaining medical students.





Statistics show that physicians tend to live within 100 miles from the location of where they received their training.

## **BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Roach / Clark) I move to approve the Midpoint Update to the Ten-Year strategic plan for Graduate Medical Education in Idaho, as provided in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

Matt Freeman, Executive Director, Idaho State Board of Education, said in FY 2018, the legislature appropriated \$70,700 (one-time) for the creation of a ten-year GME plan. Dr. Ted Epperly was engaged as a contractor to develop the plan. At a special meeting on December 5, 2017, the Board approved the first Ten-year GME Strategic Plan ("Plan"). In FY 2019, the legislature appropriated \$80,000 (ongoing) for a GME committee to oversee the implementation of new GME programs and to advise decision-makers on the medical education pipeline. Dr. Ted Epperly was hired on contract as the GME Coordinator for the state.

Dr. Hill asked if either the pandemic or the ages of current physicians have been a drain on the strategic plan.

Dr. Epperly said yes. The pandemic did disrupt the 10-year plan and it should be considered a 12-year plan as corrections are made to the strategic plan due to pandemic fall out. The pandemic crisis also hastened physician retirements. Currently, over thirty percent of the medical work force in Idaho are over the age of 60, so more retirements are on the horizon.

Superintendent Critchfield asked about the long-range plan in addressing the shortages in rural Idaho in getting more physicians and medical staff into those areas.

Dr. Epperly said paying particular attention to placing physicians in rural and frontier areas is important. A focus on having family medicine doctors live and work in rural areas is ongoing. There are currently twelve family medicine programs in the state specializing in sending people out to rural areas.

Dr. Clark asked Dr. Epperly to explain the rural training tracks.

Dr. Epperly said that rural training tracks are specific training programs internal to medical residency where the first track is done in a larger urban area with the later two years being done in smaller locations. These training tracks are happening in rural areas all over Idaho. Dr. Epperly also mentioned that loan repayment programs are also in place for medical professionals in various disciplines who go into rural and underserved areas of the state.





There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

## **PLANNING, POLICY AND GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS**

### **2. Idaho Division of Career Technical Education (CTE) Annual Report**

Dr. Clay Long, Administrator, Career Technical Education, gave the annual report to the Board and he started by saying that CTE's mission is to prepare Idaho's youth and adults for high-skill, in demand careers.

For the secondary snapshot; in the last 5 years there has been a 31 percent growth in total programs in the secondary level; CTE services 149 school districts and 16 CTE schools service 18 percent of students enrolled or over 19,000 students. Last year the Legislature created the CTE workforce readiness and CTE diploma. For the first year just under 1,700 diplomas were awarded. Overall 70,000 students were enrolled in the secondary programs throughout the state. Ninety-three percent of CTE students graduate versus eighty percent of all high school graduates; and lastly, fifty percent of high school CTE concentrators went on to college versus only thirty-eight percent of all Idaho graduates.

For the Technical College System there are two programs running from two Idaho colleges and four running from the four Idaho community colleges. For last year over 1,800 certificates were awarded which was an 8 percent increase from the prior year; ninety-two percent technical college students found jobs, continued their education or went into the military and seventy-five percent obtained employment related to their CTE training. Over 5,500 students were enrolled in over 284 programs earning 98,429 year-end credits. This was the first year for Fire Service training program and there was a 31 percent growth in the number of enrollments.

For Adult Education more than 4,100 students were served. Eighty-six percent of GED test takers did not finish high school for various economic and academic reasons. However, the GED pass rate in Idaho is eighty-four percent compared to a seventy-six percent pass rate in the rest of the country.

For SkillStack, over 25,000 unique learners have been awarded at least one badge up from 12,000 in just one school year. Verified industry partners can login, identify a specific set of microcredentials related to their hiring needs, and send a customized email to potential candidates that possess the desired skills – all within the SkillStack® platform. (For a more complete description of SkillStack please reference; <https://cte.idaho.gov/programs-2/skillstack/>).

For fiscal year 2023 the three CTE priorities are; design and develop a comprehensive program data management system; complete program prioritization and standards revision and identify and improve processes.



Dr. Clark asked for clarification on the term secondary. Dr. Long stated this was the term used for 9 - 12th graders.

Board President Liebich asked, of the 115 school districts in Idaho, how many offer CTE courses. Dr. Long said every school district is required to offer CTE programs and many offer more than one program depending on where they are.

Mr. Freeman asked Dr. Long to clarify what a concentrator is. Dr. Long said a concentrator is a student who has gone through a program of study - a sequential three semesters for regular programs and five semesters for career technical programs, so the courses are stacked for them.

Mr. Freeman asked if there was any data as to how many students had been placed in jobs due to earning the SkillStack badges. Dr. Long said no data is currently available, but the plan is to have that data metric for next year's report.

Dr. Hill asked about industrial certifications. Dr. Long said every CTE program has certification areas listed to identify the area of study. For the CTE diploma an individual, or the districts, have the opportunity to leverage the badges within SkillStack or within industry certification.

Dr. Clark asked about the grants that came from the Legislature this funding cycle. Dr. Long said the modernization and expansion grants were awarded in the amount of \$4 million for secondary and \$4 million for post-secondary. Schools were allowed to use these funds to expand programs, purchase new equipment and expand facilities for better training.

A discussion ensued about Idaho having a common student information system that becomes a link to the skills that employers want. Using the SkillStack Ecosystem infrastructure was discussed as perhaps being a way to move this need forward. More discussion with stakeholders from various programs around Idaho will need to happen to address this important matter.

At this time the Board took a 10-minute break returning at 9:18 a.m. (MT).

### 3. Idaho Public Charter School Commission Annual Report

Jenn Thompson, Director, Idaho Public Charter School Commission (IPCSC), gave the annual report to the Board.



Ms. Thompson started by saying that the IPCSC became a State Agency in FY 2022. The IPCSC has seven Governor appointed members on its Commission and a small office staff.

Charter Schools started operating in Idaho in 1998 and the Commission was created in 2004. Currently there are 64 authorized charter schools in Idaho with two petitions pending. There are an additional 15 charter schools authorized by districts in Idaho and in FY 2022, 29,000 students attended charter schools, representing 9 percent of public education students.

IPCSC publishes three annual reports all available on their website. They are the Individual School Annual Performance Report, Agency-Wide Annual Performance Report, and the 5-Year Strategic Plan.

In the last year there were eight petitions for new charter schools; four of them were approved, two are still pending and two withdrew from consideration. When the Commission began there were a lot of mom and pop charter schools in Idaho but today they are mostly corporate backing and professionally written applications.

Charter Schools are reviewed every five years. This year there are 17 charter schools being reviewed. Ten of those schools will be recommended to continue without conditions. Seven of those schools will be renewed but with conditions and the conditions range from minor to major issues.

IPCSC also reviews academic outcomes for each charter school in comparison to each other, and then to the other educational options parents have in their communities (public and private schools). This data is used when a charter school application comes up for renewal.

Board President Liebich asked if long term projections were possible to know when Idaho has reached charter school saturation. Ms. Thompson said urban areas have more students in charter schools, or between 30 - 40 percent. In more suburban areas that number is 12-15 percent. The number of students attending charter schools in Idaho is pretty steady even as Idaho's population growth continues.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

#### 4. CREDO Presentation – Update

Macke Raymond, Director, Center for Research on Education Outcomes (CREDO) at Stanford University, said CREDO was asked to analyze the academic outcomes of charter schools in Idaho via a grant through BLUUM. Also present was James Lyn Woodworth, Research Fellow at CREDO.



### Highlights from the report:

- Growth is estimated by comparing the performance on the state assessment of each student with their previous year's performance.
- Students are matched on 6 characteristics such as race / ethnicity, gender, English proficiency, lunch status (which shows economic status), IEP status and grade level along with prior test scores.
- Brick and Mortar charter schools have grown by 13.6 percent while virtual charter schools have shown a decrease.
- Enrollment in brick and mortar schools saw an almost 20 percent grown rate, while virtual charter schools saw a 22.5 percent decrease in enrollment.
- Idaho also is unusual in that the number of students who qualify for free and reduced lunch in charter schools is lower than the numbers in traditional schools. Idaho has more white students attending charter schools, while the number of Hispanic students is lower. These stats are reverse of the national data.
- For academic performance charter schools are performing poorly in math scores but holding steady in reading. Breaking down the data further shows that virtual charter schools perform less well than brick and mortar charter schools in both math and reading.
- Students in rural charter schools are doing better in math and reading than their counterparts in other states.
- In summary virtual charters have not improved since the previous study; the performance of brick-and-mortar charters has become more varied and seems to have slipped from the previous study.

Superintendent Critchfield asked for their definition of rural. Mr. Woodworth said typically that is any school that is 20 miles away from an urban area.

Board President Liebich said there are two virtual charter schools in Idaho, those approved by the IPCSC and those approved by the local districts. Did CREDO dissect those two different types of charter schools to see which are performing better. Mr. Woodworth said, no they did not slice that data further into schools approved by the IPCSC verses the districts.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

Dr. Clark asked to move agenda item No. 7 up so that the PPGA presentations were done prior to any action items being discussed.

### 7. IKEEP Program Presentation



Dr. Yolanda Bisbee, Vice-Chair, Indian Education Committee, introduced Dr. Vanessa Anthony-Stevens, Associate Professor of Social and Cultural Studies, University of Idaho; Dr. Shawna Campbell-Daniels, IKEEP Director, and Christina Toneekia Hernandez, teacher at Owyhee Combined School, who gave the IKEEP (Indigenous Knowledge for Effective Education Program) presentation.

- IKEEP at the University of Idaho prepares and certifies culturally responsive indigenous teachers to meet the unique needs of American Indian students in K-12 public schools.
- Native American/Alaskan Native youths experience greater academic success when their cultures, languages and community values are included in classroom pedagogy.
- IKEEP works to recruit, prepare, certify and place culturally responsive American Indian educators into teaching positions in schools with high populations of American Indian students.
- IKEEP's model of induction service, professional development, and master Indigenous teacher mentorship is foundational to improving retention (and wellness) of Native teachers who contribute a high-level of specialized Indigenous and Western pedagogical knowledge that benefits all students across Idaho.
- The indigenous Educator Framework was developed by the indigenous knowledge for effective education program and used to strengthen sovereignty through indigenous teacher excellence.
- Since it began in 2016 IKEEP has had three cohorts of students. Cohort 1 had 5 graduates, Cohort 2 has 8 graduates currently receiving their final year of induction services and support, and Cohort 3 has 11 current scholars spanning nine federally recognized tribes in Idaho, Wyoming, Utah, Montana, Oregon and Arizona.
- IKEEP has seen a 400-500 percent increase in American Indian and Alaskan native enrollment in their teacher preparation programs.
- Professional Development modules are offered in Introduction to Indian Education in Idaho and Tribal Sovereignty and Federal Indian Policy: Impacts of Native Education.
- IKEEP research has yielded promising findings that support the positive outcomes of indigenous scholars to develop and apply culturally responsive, self-determination centered approaches to teaching and learning with indigenous youth.

Board President Liebich asked what is the ideal size of the cohort as they begin to expand. Dr. Anthony-Stevens said a cohort size of 12-24 people would be significant but that would need continued support.



Mrs. Roach asked if IKEEP was working on getting more grants, such as the NSF award they received in 2022. Dr. Anthony-Stevens said IKEEP works very hard to get grants but local level contributions would go a long way in furthering their mission.

Dr. Clark asked what percentage of their work was done by grants. Dr. Anthony-Stevens said nearly 100 percent of their work is funded by grants.

Dr. Clark asked that this topic be added to the next Indian Education Committee meeting since all institutions are represented on that committee as well. She asked that a discussion happen with an eye toward what resources would it take to replicate this program in other areas of Idaho and how to use what IKEEP has learned to perhaps help the Hispanic community recruit and cultivate teachers of their own.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

At this time the Board took a 10-minute break returning at 10:29 a.m. (MT)

#### 5. K-20 Education Strategic Plan and IRI Performance Data

Tracie Bent, Chief Policy, Planning and Governmental Affairs Officer, Idaho State Board of Education, started by clarifying an earlier question about virtual schools. School districts are not allowed to authorize virtual charter schools so the programs mentioned would not be included in the data presented. Previously no data has been extracted from school district virtual schools but with the increase of those programs because of the pandemic the Board may wish to change this data collection moving forward.

Based on that statement, Dr. Clark thinks that school districts who have virtual schools should report them as separate buildings and not leave that determination to the district as to how they report the data to the Board.

Ms. Bent reviewed the changes to the FY 2023 Strategic Plan saying the changes noted in Attachment 1 came from the December 2022 Board meeting. Of special note on page 5, Attachment 1, the Board removed the 60 percent rule last year. A different objective would be to say that all high school seniors leave high school college and career ready which allows the Board to look at various measures instead of looking at a single measure.

Ms. Bent mentioned the highlighted measure found on page 8, Attachment 1, Percentage of high school students participating in apprenticeships and postsecondary students participating in internships. This is a new benchmark for the Board added last year. The Planning, Policy, and Governmental Affairs Committee thought this measure was important to leave in the plan because it is an important piece of the work the Board is doing.



Additional amendments to the document were noted that did not amend the overall goals and objectives but added additional specificity to the performance measures to assure all of the measures were reported using the same methodology between postsecondary institutions where applicable to assure the data could be rolled together at the state level for the Board's plan.

## **BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Roach) I move to approve the FY 2024-2029 K-20 Education Strategic plan as provided in Attachment 1 including the additional items that the Board discussed at this meeting.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

Board President Liebich said this Board is very aware that for students to be successful, 60 percent of them will need a post-secondary degree or certificate.

Mrs. Roach said while many of the measures have been removed from the strategic plan, the measure kept (page 7, Attachment 1, Percent of students who complete the Free Application for Federal Student Aid (FAFSA)) really does not address affordability. She asked Ms. Bent which measure should be added back to the strategic plan to measure affordability. Ms. Bent said nationally there is much discussion on affordability and the one measure she would recommend to be put back into the strategic plan can be found on the bottom of page 7, Attachment 1, average net price to attend public institutions.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

## 6. 2023 Legislative Update

Dr. Clark prefaced the discussion by letting everyone know that the bills before the Legislature are in flux and thus this agenda item is just to familiarize the Board with these bills but the Board will not take any action today either in support or opposition to any of this legislation.

Ms. Bent reviewed the 2023 Legislative bills as they pertain to the Board.

**HB92** – The proposed legislation creates the requirement that schools serving students in grades 9 through 12 provide one or more courses in personal financial literacy and money management. Completion of this course would fulfill the financial literacy graduation requirement the Board approved at the August 2022 Regular Board meeting as part of the proposed rulemaking process. This bill passed through the House and was referred to the Senate Education Committee.





**HB114** - Abuse of school employees - Amends existing law to provide that abusing public school employees who are acting within the course and scope of their duties is a misdemeanor. Reported Printed and Referred to House Judiciary, Rules & Administration.

**HB139** - School and library protection act - Adds to existing law to prohibit distribution of certain materials to children. Any minor child who accesses such material in violation of this policy would be entitled to bring a civil action against the school or library. Reported Printed and Referred to House Education.

**HB 140** - Classroom behavior management - Amends existing law to revise provisions regarding classroom behavior management. Provides guidance on the definitions and use of restraint and seclusion. Reported Printed and Referred to House Education.

Superintendent Critchfield mentioned the bills SDE has been specifically asked to partner with a Legislator. One of them is **HB140**. SDE is working with various Legislators such as Chairman Lent to develop legislation. Tomorrow the Superintendent will be before the House Education Committee bringing forward an RS detailing how districts work with parents. A tremendous amount of work has been done with Transparent Idaho and our State Controller in getting more information out to the community about school district funding, and lastly SDE has been working on draft legislation called Idaho Skilled Careers which would provide ongoing money for secondary, specifically 7-12th graders.

Mrs. Roach asked for an update on **S1008** - Universities, concealed weapons - Repeals and adds to existing law to revise provisions regarding concealed weapons. Prohibits the governing board for the community colleges and the State Board of Education from regulating the possession of guns on campuses. Repeals existing provisions in Section 18-3309, Idaho Code. Ms. Bent said it was referred to Senate State Affairs but has not moved forward.

Board President Liebich said **S1038** (Freedom in education savings accounts - Adds to existing law to provide for education savings accounts. Eligible expenses include tuition at private schools. Reported Printed; referred to Senate Education – Passed out of committee with a do pass recommendation, is the most profound bill coming through this Legislative session), has been a discussion with this Board long before he joined the Board. This Board is supportive of school choice and they see the benefits of it. This issue is not going to go away. He further said that he has specific criteria that would compel him to support this legislation. First, any expansion of school choice cannot take away from the legal obligation to offer a uniform and thorough system of public education. Second, any program should have a system of means testing. Third, any program cannot dilute resources from rural schools and fourth there has to be some level of accountability.



Mrs. Siddoway said she sees this as a national movement and dislikes seeing money pour into Idaho to sway this legislation. She believes this should be an Idaho decision and focus on issues of accountability and rural emphasis so that we do no harm.

Ms. Bent mentioned the temporary administrative rule that will expire at the end of the session. The Board will need to consider a new temporary rule that will take the districts through the end of the school year. Dr. Clark said this item will be brought up at the April Board meeting.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

#### 8. Board Policy I.J. Use of Institutional Facilities and Services with Regard to the Private Sector - First Reading

Ms. Bent said in February 2020 the Board approved the first reading of proposed amendment to Board Policy I.J. to remove the reporting requirement for president-approved alcohol permits at each regularly scheduled Board meeting, and allow events in conjunction with student athletic events to be approved by the institution's chief executive officer within the same restrictions as other permissible events. The Board requested that additional changes be made to ensure complete delegation to the CEO's of the institutions, specifically to remove the stipulation that attendees of a Permitted Event must receive a ticket, registration, or invitation.

Expanding this policy would allow institutions to be able to include alcohol service at the golf course. This is a first reading and language can be tightened up before the second reading. This policy is not institution specific.

#### **BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Clark / Hill) I move to approve the first reading of amendments to Board Policy I.J. Use of Institutional Facilities and Services with Regard to the Private Sector, as submitted in Attachment 1. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.**

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

#### 9. Student Appeal – Armed Forces and Public Safety Officer Scholarship

Ms. Bent said that from time to time the Board is asked to take up appeals, not to hear the appeals but in this case to utilize a hearing officer appointed through the Office of Administrative Hearings to serve as the presiding officer and schedule and hear the appeal.



## BOARD ACTION

**M/S (Clark / Roach) I move to direct the Board's executive director to work with the Office of Administrative Hearings to have a hearing officer appointed to serve as the presiding officer and schedule and hear Mr. Burlile's appeal. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.**

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

### 10. Educator Pipeline Report

Kathleen Shoup, Educator Effectiveness Program Manager, Idaho State Board of Education, gave the pipeline report sharing the following with the Board.

- From 2014-2015 to 2019 the percent retention rate in state for instructional staff increased reaching a high of 91.7 percent in 2020. After the pandemic the retention rate fell to 88.6 percent.
- The retention rates for the 2021-2022 school year shows that Idaho retains teachers at a higher rate at a Local Education Agency or state level versus at the school level.
- Next year retention rates are the highest for Instructional staff on the Professional rung (*4-7 years of experience*) and Advanced Professional/ Professional rung (*8 or more years of experience*).
- Data shows that most people who come into teaching decide within the first three years if this is a good fit for them or not, which is where the retention rates are the lowest. Retention rates for those with more than four years of experience is therefore higher.
- According to pre-pandemic statistics about 8 percent of teachers nationally shift schools and 8 percent leave the field completely.
- For retention rates for teachers in their 2nd - 5th year there is a decrease in retention from second year to third year, etc. Nationally 44 percent of teachers leave the profession in the first 5 years. Ten percent leave after 1 year. Special Ed teachers leave at a higher rate or 2.5 times a regular teacher.
- Retention rates for pupil service staff; counselors, nurses, audiologists, pathologists and physical therapists, fluctuates from year to year with a lower retention by people with 8 or more years of experience.
- The Idaho locales with the highest teacher retention are in mid-size cities, small cities and rural remote teachers. Idaho's lowest teacher retention rates are in suburban mid and small size districts and in rural distant education.
- States across the nation have been working to address educator shortages and have implemented programs to recruit and retain education staff. Some current programs that have been implemented throughout the nation to attract and retain educational staff are the following:
  - ❖ Alternative Routes to Educator Certification\*



- ❖ Increase Education Personnel Salaries\*
  - ❖ Mentoring Programs for New Teachers (*\*Required in Idaho, but not funded*)
  - ❖ Professional Development\*
  - ❖ Recognition Programs (Teacher/Employee/Administrator of the Year, Achievement Awards, Leadership Awards) \*
  - ❖ Tuition Reimbursement (*\*Rural and Underserved Educator Incentive Program*)
- Of special note is that currently there is more of a problem in recruiting new teachers verses retaining them.

Board President Liebich asked if the districts do exit interviews to find out why teachers are leaving the profession. Ms. Bent said some districts do but we do not collect that data. Mrs. Shoup said there is a teacher follow-up survey conducted by the US Census Bureau that can provide some further data concerning teacher retention.

Dr. Clark asked how many districts have the three-year mentor program in place. Ms. Bent said the Board office can reach out to all of the districts to get confirmation on how they are handling their mentoring programs since they are required to have a program in place by law.

Mrs. Roach asked about the national trend where some school districts are going from five-day school weeks to a four-day school week. Is data being collected to see if this approach is helping with retaining teachers. Dr. Clark said data shows that there is exponential growth in teacher retention in those districts who went to a four-day school week but some superintendents felt forced to go to a four-day school week because they couldn't hire teachers who would go to neighboring districts who did offer four-day work weeks. This movement does have negative consequences for low performing and minority populations.

Ms. Bent asked what would the Board like to do next on this issue. Board President Liebich said finding the reason behind why teachers are leaving the profession is the first step. Superintendent Critchfield said research into this area might show such factors as increases in pay, the state contributing more to health insurance costs and improving the overall tone of being an educator will help with retention.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

At this time Dr. Linda Clark asked for executive privilege. Dr. Clark mentioned that this was Tracie Bent's last meeting as the Policy, Planning and Governmental Affairs Officer since she had taken a new position with Career Technical Education. Dr. Clark publicly thanked Tracie Bent for her dedication to the Office of the State Board of Education and for all of her assistance in making Dr. Clark's tenure as Chair of PPGA so easy.



## **INFORMATIONAL**

### **IRSA**

1. Semi-annual Report of Executive Director Approved Program Requests
2. Higher Education Research Council Annual Report

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

There being no further business a motion to adjourn was entertained.

## **BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Hill / Keough) I move to adjourn the meeting at 11:37 a.m.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion carried 8-0.